IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF WOOD COUNTY, WEST VIRGINIA BUSINESS COURT DIVISION

HIGHMARK WEST VIRGINIA INC.,

Plaintiff

V.

CIVIL ACTION NO. 18-C-271 Presiding Judge: Shawn D. Nines Resolution Judge: Christopher Wilkes

MEDTEST LABORATORIES, LLC, BRICE TAYLOR, BILLY TAYLOR, MUHAMMAD AMJAD, PH. D., MICHAEL CHEN, PH. D., JAMES TAYLOR, CENEGEN, LLC, and VITAS LABORATORY LLC,

Defendants.

MEDTEST LABORATORIES, LLC,

Counterclaim and Third-Party Plaintiff,

v.

HIGHMARK WEST VIRGINIA INC., et al.,

Counterclaim and Third-Party Defendants.

ORDER DENYING DEFENDANT MICHAEL CHEN, PH. D.'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT

Defendant Michael Chen, Ph. D.'s Motion for Summary Judgment was heard by this Court during its Pre-Trial Conference of April 29, 2022. Scott H. Kaminski, Esq. of Ray, Winton & Kelley PLLC advanced the Motion as attorney of record for defendant Chen. Stuart A. McMillan and Peter G. Markham of Bowles Rice LLP opposed the Motion as attorneys of record for plaintiff Highmark West Virginia Inc. ("Highmark WV").

5/13/22 CCX 9 to Bowles Rein; Billy Taylor, Med Test, Vitus; James Taylor; Brisitaylor; Ceneger; S. H. Karninski; Muhammad MAY 1 2 2022

CELESTE RIDGWAY CLERK CIRCUIT COURT Having considered the arguments of counsel, the pertinent authorities, the memoranda of law filed by the parties, and the relevant evidence of record—including the deposition testimony of defendant Chen—this Court FINDS and CONCLUDES that there are genuine issues of material fact to be determined by the jury regarding defendant Chen's liability on plaintiff Highmark WV's claims of fraud, civil conspiracy, and negligence. Accordingly, this Court DENIES defendant Chen's Motion for Summary Judgment.

The Court notes the exceptions and objections of all parties to any adverse rulings. This Court **DIRECTS** the Clerk to enter this Order and forward attested copies to the Business Court Central Office at Business Court Division, 380 West South Street, Suite 2100, Martinsburg, West Virginia 25401, as well as to the parties and counsel listed below.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

ENTERED this 11th day of May, 2022.

JUDGE SHAWN D. NINES

JUDGE OF THE WEST VIRGINIA BUSINESS COURT DIVISION

Forward attested copies to:

Stuart A. McMillan, Esq.
Peter G. Markham, Esq.
Gabriele Wohl, Esq.
BOWLES RICE LLP
600 Quarrier Street
Charleston, West Virginia 25301
Counsel for Plaintiff Highmark West Virginia Inc.

Billy Taylor Washington County Detention Center 1155 W Clydesdale Drive Fayetteville, Arkansas 72701 **Defendant, Pro Se**

MedTest Laboratories, LLC c/o Billy Taylor Washington County Detention Center 1155 W Clydesdale Drive Fayetteville, Arkansas 72701 Defendant

Vitas Laboratory, LLC c/o Billy Taylor Washington County Detention Center 1155 W Clydesdale Drive Fayetteville, Arkansas 72701 Defendant

James Taylor, Jr.
4608 NE 93rd Place
Oklahoma City, Oklahoma 73131
Jimbotaylorl@gmail.com
Defendant, Pro Se

Brice Taylor 861 E 33rd Street Edmund, OK 73103 Bricetaylor62@gmail.com Defendant, Pro Se

Cenegen, LLC 861 E 33rd Street Edmund, Oklahoma 73103 Bricetaylor62@gmail.com Defendant

Scott H. Kaminski, Esquire RAY, WINTON & KELLEY, PLLC 109 Capitol St., Ste. 700 Charleston, West Virginia 25301 scottkaminski@rwk-law.com Counsel for Defendant Michael Chen, Ph.D.

Muhammad Amjad, Ph.D. 2006 Springdale Road Hurricane, West Virginia 25526 Amjad.ca@hotmail.com

Defendant, Pro Se

4