

LEWIS COUNTY W.V.
2020 MAR 13 PM2:56

✓
CC

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF LEWIS COUNTY, WEST VIRGINIA
BUSINESS COURT DIVISION

CONSOL ENERGY, INC.
DBA CNX GAS COMPANY, LLC,

FILED - CIRCUIT CLERK

Petitioner,

vs.

Presiding Judge: Christopher C. Wilkes
Civil Action No. 17-C-11

THE HONORABLE DALE STEAGER
West Virginia State Tax Commissioner,
THE HONORABLE JOHN L. BREEN,
Assessor of McDowell County, and
THE COUNTY COMMISSION OF LEWIS COUNTY,
Sitting as a Board of Assessment Appeals,

Respondents.

AGREED FINAL ORDER
RE-VALUING PRODUCING OIL AND NATURAL GAS
WELLS FOR AD VALOREM TAX PURPOSES
FOR TAX YEAR 2016 AND DISMISSING APPEAL OF
PETITIONER CONSOL ENERGY, INC. DBA CNX GAS COMPANY, LLC

COME NOW CONSOL Energy, Inc., dba CNX Gas Company, LLC ("CNX"), by Counsel Craig Griffith, Esquire, and John Meadows, Esquire; The County Commission of Lewis County sitting as a Board of Assessment Appeals (the "BAA"); the Honorable John Breen, Assessor of Lewis County; and The Honorable Dale W. Steager, State Tax Commissioner (the "Tax Commissioner" or "Tax Department"), by Counsel L. Wayne Williams, Assistant Attorney General and pray the Business Court enter this Agreed Final Order.

CNX is the producer for numerous oil and natural gas wells located in Lewis County, West Virginia. Originally, the Tax Department valued CNX's producing oil and natural gas wells at \$26,584,032 for the 2016 tax year ("TY2016"). The Tax Department argued that its valuation was

correct under the applicable law and legislative rules. The BAA adopted the Tax Department's valuation.

CNX timely appealed the valuation for TY2016 to the Circuit Court of Lewis County; subsequently, the case was transferred to Business Court Division. Following the Business Court's decision, the matter was appealed to the West Virginia Supreme Court of Appeals, which issued a decision in June of 2019 and remanded the matter to the Business Court Division.

All parties agree that the decision in the CNX appeal must be determined according to the decision of the West Virginia Supreme Court of Appeals in *Steager v. CONSOL Energy, Inc.*, 242 W. Va. 209, 832 S.E. 2d 135 (2019).

CNX provided a list of wells for TY2016 that are subject to re-valuation by the Tax Department and Cindi Hoover, Tax & Revenue Manager of the Tax Department's Property Tax Division, Special Properties Section, re-valued the wells based on the decision in *Steager v. CONSOL Energy*, with the revised appraised values for all wells totaling \$22,086,176 for TY2016, which results in a total reduction of appraised values of \$4,497,856. A spreadsheet is attached which identifies the value of each individual well. See Exhibit A.

CNX agrees with the revised valuation for TY2016.

Furthermore, the Parties agree that the re-valuation has resolved all issues which were litigated before the Circuit Court.

The Circuit Court has reviewed the pleadings filed in this matter, the West Virginia Supreme Court decision in *Steager v. CONSOL Energy*, cited *supra*, W. Va. Code § 11-6K-1, *et seq.*, and the applicable legislative rule.

The Circuit Court finds the Final Agreed Order to be proper in all respects.

The Circuit Court finds the true and actual value of CNX's oil and natural gas wells is a total of \$22,086,176 for TY2016 in Lewis County, which results in a total reduction of appraised values of \$4,497,856, as specifically identified for every individual well and as said total reduction is shown on the attached spreadsheet.

Each party will be responsible for its own costs, expenses, and legal fees, in this matter.

The Clerk of the Circuit Court is directed to transmit a true copy of this Agreed Final Order to the counsel of record at the addresses listed below.

The matter is to be stricken from the active docket of the Circuit Court.

The matter is dismissed with prejudice.

It is so ORDERED.

Entered:

Christopher Wilkes,
Presiding Judge
Circuit Court of Lewis County
Business Court Division

Prepared by:


Craig A. Griffith, Esq. (WVSB# 8549)
John J. Meadows, Esq. (WVSB# 9442)
Counsel for CONSOL Energy, Inc., dba
CNX Gas Company, LLC
Steptoe & Johnson PLLC
P.O. Box 1588
Charleston, WV 25326-1588
304-353-8190
craig.griffith@steptoe-johnson.com

Reviewed by and Agreed to:

L. Wayne Williams (WVSB# 4370)
Assistant Attorney General
Counsel for the West Virginia State
Tax Commissioner
1900 Kanawha Boulevard, East
Building 1, Room W-435
Charleston, West Virginia 25305
304-558-2522 Tel.
l.wayne.williams@wvago.gov

Copy to:

The Honorable John Breen
Assessor of Lewis County
108 Center Avenue
PO Box 706
Weston, West Virginia 26452

The Lewis County Commission
110 Center Avenue
Weston, West Virginia 26452

CNX Gas Company, LLC
Tax Year 7/1/15-6/30/16
Lewis County, WV

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNX State Appraised Value	CNX Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNX Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNX Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	Property Tax Division Difference
4103804 Conventional	21	0100022700	03804	311418	WV002700 AUVIL,	9,690	500	9,190	9,690	500	9,190
4104927 Conventional	21	0115154927	04927	311915	WV014129 CAMDEN,	183,211	183,209	2	183,211	183,211	
4104075 Conventional	21	0130004075	04075	309333	200710292 USA 27	12,618	1,309	11,309	12,618	1,310	11,308
4104076 Conventional	21	0140004076	04076	309338	200710297 USA 28	7,709	500	7,209	7,709	500	7,209
4104136 Conventional	21	0140004136	04136	309748	200711204 SWECKE	11,482	500	10,975	11,482	500	10,975
4104137 Conventional	21	0140004137	04137	309749	200711205 SWECKE	8,894	500	8,394	8,894	500	8,394
4104139 Conventional	21	0140004139	04139	309336	200710295 USA 79	11,742	624	11,118	11,742	617	11,008
4100106 Conventional	21	0150000106	00106	314170	WEWVT008975 IB	10,806	500	10,306	10,806	500	10,306
4100707 Conventional	21	0150000707	00707	314381	WEWVT010318	9,923	500	9,423	9,923	500	9,423
4100946 Conventional	21	0150000946	00946	314822	WEWVT010397	2,511	500	2,011	2,511	500	2,011
4101322 Conventional	21	0150001322	01322	314502	WEWVT010643	3,344	500	2,844	3,344	500	2,844
4101534 Conventional	21	0150001534	01534	314591	WEWVT010885	6,156	500	5,656	6,156	500	5,656
4101806 Conventional	21	0150001806	01806	11339	1 BENNETT	1,329	500	829	1,329	500	829
4101822 Conventional	21	0150001822	01822	314723	WEWVT011426	25,652	20,333	5,319	25,652	20,332	5,320
4101855 Conventional	21	0150001855	01855	314724	WEWVT011446 IB	4,143	500	3,643	4,143	500	3,643
4101970 Conventional	21	0150001970	01970	314810	WEWVT011842	8,570	500	8,070	8,570	500	8,070
4101996 Conventional	21	0150001996	01996	314832	WEWVT011928	2,042	500	1,542	2,042	500	1,542
4102119 Conventional	21	0150002119	02119	314907	WEWVT012398	18,703	8,451	10,252	18,703	8,451	10,252
4102279 Conventional	21	0150002279	02279	313755	WEWVT004917 IM	15,113	4,224	11,889	15,113	4,224	11,889
4102695 Conventional	21	0150002695	02695	313617	WEWVT002576 IF	15,339	4,497	11,842	16,339	4,497	11,842
4103184 Conventional	21	0150003184	03184	314962	WEWVT012764	8,879	500	8,379	8,879	500	8,379
4103516 Conventional	21	0200003516	03516	309528	200710926 ARNOLD	12,861	565	12,296	12,861	565	12,296
4103517 Conventional	21	0200003517	03517	309520	200710917 ARNOLD	5,748	500	5,248	5,748	500	5,248
4103552 Conventional	21	0200003552	03552	309253	200710158 O'HENR	34,257	28,541	5,716	34,257	31,233	3,024
4103555 Conventional	21	0200003555	03555	309534	200710935 ARNOLD	6,012	500	5,512	6,012	500	5,512
4103620 Conventional	21	0200003620	03620	309540	200710942 PRATT	63,649	45,350	18,299	63,649	62,818	831
4103633 Conventional	21	0200003633	03633	309548	200710950 ASPINA	8,666	500	8,166	8,666	500	8,166
4103665 Conventional	21	0200003665	03665	309556	200710959 FURY 1	5,487	500	4,987	5,487	500	4,987
4103774 Conventional	21	0200003774	03774	309485	200710866 BRINKL	21,760	11,234	10,026	21,760	11,233	10,027
4103833 Conventional	21	0200003833	03833	309507	200710901 TAYLOR	2,050	500	1,550	2,050	500	1,550
4103844 Conventional	21	0200003844	03844	309524	200710922 TAYLOR	2,522	500	2,022	2,522	500	2,022

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNX State		CNX Appraised Value	Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNX Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNX Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Supreme Court Decision	Property Tax Division Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Difference
						Appraised Value	Value Difference							
4103922 Conventional	21	0200003922	03922	317540	200710372 ROME1	4,947	500	4,447	2,707	7-1	2,433	2,433	2,433	
4103967 Conventional	21	0210003967	03967	309618	200711033 FINSTE	28,009	23,213	4,797	28,009	23,213	4,796	4,796	4,796	
4103972 Conventional	21	0210003972	03972	317560	200710406 DTWV 1	11,112	826	10,286	28,451	492	9,026	9,026	9,026	
4103974 Conventional	21	0210003974	03974	317886	200710245 FISHER	12,736	944	11,792	5,674	432	5,367	5,367	5,367	
4104014 Conventional	21	0210004014	04014	309658	200711078 NOLAN	4,450	500	3,950	4,450	500	3,950	3,950	3,950	
4104015 Conventional	21	0210004015	04015	309659	200711079 NOLAN	33,936	32,131	1,805	33,936	32,131	1,805	1,805	1,805	
4104019 Conventional	21	0210004019	04019	309662	200711082 FINSTE	6,167	500	5,667	6,167	500	5,667	5,667	5,667	
4104035 Conventional	21	0210004035	04035	309660	200711080 FINSTE	22,787	14,602	8,180	22,787	14,602	8,180	8,180	8,180	
4104036 Conventional	21	0210004036	04036	309663	200711081 FINSTE	13,923	1,881	12,042	13,923	1,882	12,041	12,041	12,041	
4104573 Conventional	21	0216144573	04573	311667	WV00605911 BENETT,	43,892	43,892		43,892	43,892		43,892	43,892	
4104652 Conventional	21	0214144652	04652	311703	WV00606228 GIBSON,	46,083	43,895	2,188	46,083	43,895	2,188	2,188	2,188	
4104653 Conventional	21	0214144653	04653	311704	WV00606229 GIBSON,	42,333	32,812	9,521	42,333	38,752	3,581	3,581	3,581	
4104654 Conventional	21	0214144654	04654	311705	WV00606230 GIBSON,	37,630	35,518	2,112	37,630	33,704	3,926	3,926	3,926	
4104655 Conventional	21	0214144655	04655	311706	WV00606231 GIBSON,	16,723	12,401	4,322	16,723	12,407	4,321	4,321	4,321	
4104656 Conventional	21	0214144656	04656	311707	WV00606232 GIBSON,	30,164	20,815	9,349	30,164	24,378	5,786	5,786	5,786	
4104657 Conventional	21	0214144657	04657	311709	WV00606234 SKINNER	47,764	38,737	9,027	47,764	44,037	3,727	3,727	3,727	
4104690 Conventional	21	0215154690	04690	311733	WV00606311 BURKHAM	7,502	500	7,002	7,502	500	7,002	7,002	7,002	
4104691 Conventional	21	0215154691	04691	311734	WV00606312 BURKHAM	4,259	500	3,759	4,259	500	3,759	3,759	3,759	
4104693 Conventional	21	0215154693	04693	311735	WV00606314 DUNCAN,	12,986	6,614	6,372	12,986	6,614	6,372	6,372	6,372	
4104707 Conventional	21	0215154707	04707	311731	WV00606309 MERTZ,	9,536	500	9,036	9,536	500	9,036	9,036	9,036	
4104708 Conventional	21	0215154708	04708	311732	WV00606310 MERTZ,	6,602	500	6,102	6,602	500	6,102	6,102	6,102	
4104712 Conventional	21	0215154712	04712	311741	WV00606334 JARVIS,	37,844	28,214	9,630	37,844	28,211	9,633	9,633	9,633	

CNX Gas Company, LLC
Tax Year 7/1/15-6/30/16
Lewis County, WV

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNR State Appraised Value	CNR Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNR Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNR Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Value Difference
4104835	Conventional	21	0215154835	04835	311791 WV006590 PRIEST,	22,855	22,855		22,855	21,591	\$ 1,264
4104845	Conventional	21	0215154845	04845	311821 WV006631 TETER,	14,784	8,740	6,044	14,784	7,461	\$ 7,323
4104846	Conventional	21	0215154846	04846	311819 WV006629 TETER,	54,061	54,060	1	54,061	54,061	\$
4104847	Conventional	21	0215154847	04847	311820 WV006630 TETER,	9,785	2,488	7,297	9,785	2,489	\$ 7,296
4104848	Conventional	21	0215154848	04848	311817 WV006627 WARD, H	27,911	26,801	1,110	27,911	25,252	\$ 2,659
4104849	Conventional	21	0215154849	04849	311818 WV006628 WARD, H	25,937	25,937		25,937	25,937	\$
4104857	Conventional	21	0216164857	04857	311806 WV006616 CASEY,	59,505	55,169	4,336	59,505	56,368	\$ 3,137
4104858	Conventional	21	0216164858	04858	311807 WV006617 CASEY,	71,881	71,881		71,881	71,881	\$
4104859	Conventional	21	0216164859	04859	311808 WV006618 CASEY,	45,774	45,774		45,774	45,774	\$
4104865	Conventional	21	0216164865	04865	311842 WV006723 EDWARDS	15,778	3,819	11,959	15,778	3,820	\$ 11,958
4104867	Conventional	21	0216164867	04867	311841 WV006722 BURNS,	140,363	139,256	1,107	140,363	135,165	\$ 5,198
4104868	Conventional	21	0216164868	04868	311822 WV006632 EDMAISTO	16,124	4,237	11,887	16,124	4,238	\$ 11,886
4104869	Conventional	21	0216164869	04869	311823 WV006633 EDMAISTO	3,219	500	2,719	3,219	500	\$ 2,719
4104870	Conventional	21	0216164870	04870	311824 WV006634 EDMAISTO	1,117	500	617	1,117	500	\$ 617
4104871	Conventional	21	0216164871	04871	311825 WV006635 EDMAISTO	11,088	500	10,588	11,088	500	\$ 10,588
4104872	Conventional	21	0216164872	04872	311798 WV006607 MURRAY,	30,901	29,281	1,620	30,901	28,125	\$ 2,776
4104873	Conventional	21	0216164873	04873	311799 WV006608 MURRAY,	53,065	52,614	451	53,065	49,766	\$ 3,299
4104874	Conventional	21	0216164874	04874	311800 WV006609 MURRAY,	10,888	7,953	2,935	10,888	2,565	\$ 8,323
4104875	Conventional	21	0216164875	04875	311801 WV006610 MURRAY,	17,823	12,486	5,337	17,823	12,196	\$ 5,627
4104876	Conventional	21	0216164876	04876	311802 WV006611 MURRAY,	12,088	5,313	6,775	12,088	5,313	\$ 6,775
4104887	Conventional	21	0216164887	04887	311804 WV006613 MURRAY,	16,191	11,408	4,783	16,191	9,442	\$ 6,749
4104888	Conventional	21	0216164888	04888	311809 WV006619 CUMMING	6,165	500	5,665	6,165	500	\$ 5,665
4104889	Conventional	21	0216164889	04889	311810 WV006620 CUMMING	6,190	500	5,690	6,190	500	\$ 5,690
4104891	Conventional	21	0216164891	04891	311828 WV006639 EDWARDS	16,410	5,356	11,054	16,410	5,355	\$ 11,055
4104932	Conventional	21	0216164932	04932	311803 WV006612 MURRAY,	20,741	20,741		20,741	17,183	\$ 3,558
4104942	Conventional	21	0216164942	04942	311805 WV006615 MURRAY,	20,321	18,484	1,837	20,321	18,483	\$ 1,838
4104943	Conventional	21	0216164943	04943	311808 WV006616 MURRAY,	19,434	8,547	10,887	19,434	8,547	\$ 10,887
4104944	Conventional	21	0216164944	04944	311950 WV014262 MURRAY,	10,429	3,225	7,204	10,429	3,224	\$ 7,205
4104945	Conventional	21	0216164945	04945	311951 WV014264 MURRAY,	9,861	2,575	7,286	9,861	2,575	\$ 7,286
4104995	Conventional	21	0216164995	04995	311813 WV006623 WHITE,	13,720	6,699	7,021	13,720	5,995	\$ 7,725
						62,539	62,538	1	62,539	62,539	\$

CNR Gas Company, LLC
 Tax Year 7/1/15-6/30/16
 Lewis County, WV

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNR State Appraised Value	CNR Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNR Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNR Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Supreme Court Decision	Property Tax Value Difference
4104996 Conventional		21	0216164996	04996	311812 WV006622 WHITE,	10,752	3,594	7,158	10,752	3,594	7,158
4104997 Conventional		21	0216164997	04997	311811 WV006621 WHITE,	15,794	10,867	4,927	15,794	10,866	4,928
4104853 Conventional		21	0217174853	04853	311795 WV006604 CONLEY,	21,376	20,370	1,006	21,376	20,370	1,006
4104854 Conventional		21	0217174854	04854	311796 WV006605 CONLEY,	71,997	71,996	1	71,997	71,997	
4104855 Conventional		21	0217174855	04855	311797 WV006606 CONLEY,	28,359	27,590	769	28,359	22,588	5,771
4104892 Conventional		21	0217174892	04892	311844 WV006725 FETER,	10,196	500	9,696	10,196	500	9,696
4104994 Conventional		21	0217174994	04994	311815 WV006625 WHITE,	12,314	4,894	7,420	12,314	4,894	7,420
4105013 Conventional		21	0217175013	05013	311971 WV014392 PLETCHER,	30,550	28,754	1,796	30,550	27,802	2,748
4105022 Conventional		21	0217175022	05022	311961 WV014380 FEALEY,	87,605	87,605		87,605	84,166	3,439
4105023 Conventional		21	0217175023	05023	311962 WV014381 FEALEY,	25,118	24,317	801	25,118	22,491	2,627
4105024 Conventional		21	0217175024	05024	311972 WV014393 PLETCHER,	51,583	51,583		51,583	51,583	
4105054 Conventional		21	0217175054	05054	311973 WV014394 GILLOOL,	20,639	20,639		20,639	18,553	2,086
4105067 Conventional		21	0217175067	05067	311965 WV014384 BOHAN,	10,408	10,408		10,408	3,629	6,779
4105078 Conventional		21	0217175078	05078	312019 WV014571 EDMISTO,	19,584	2,204	17,380	19,584	2,204	17,380
4105084 Conventional		21	0217175084	05084	312042 WV014603 GIBSON,	9,478	2,138	7,340	9,478	2,318	7,160
4105087 Conventional		21	0217175087	05087	311814 WV006624 WHITE,	19,858	17,655	2,203	19,858	17,655	2,203
4105100 Conventional		21	0217175100	05100	312024 WV014579 BURNS,	45,031	45,031		45,031	45,031	
4105066 Conventional		21	0218185066	05066	311963 WV014382 MCANAIN	20,121	9,548	10,573	20,121	6,800	13,321
4105076 Conventional		21	0218185076	05076	311964 WV014383 MCANAIN	11,745	4,817	6,928	11,745	4,816	6,929
4105079 Conventional		21	0218185079	05079	311964 WV014383 MCANAIN	14,776	500	14,276	14,776	835	13,941
4105099 Conventional		21	0218185099	05099	312020 WV014574 BEACHER,	28,455	28,455		28,455	28,455	
4105171 Conventional		21	0218185171	05171	311969 WV014390 LINGER,	25,086	24,661	425	25,086	22,434	2,652
4105176 Conventional		21	0218185176	05176	311966 WV014386 BOHAN,	9,574	500	9,074	9,574	500	9,074
4105181 Conventional		21	0218185181	05181	312241 WV015125 TURNER,	5,655	500	5,155	5,655	500	5,155
4105182 Conventional		21	0218185182	05182	312043 WV014604 CAMDEN,	31,990	30,068	1,922	31,990	30,068	1,922
4105189 Conventional		21	0218185189	05189	312044 WV014605 CAMDEN,	36,812	36,812		36,812	35,345	2,943
4105199 Conventional		21	0218185199	05199	312091 WV014698 SKINNER	10,056	2,788	7,258	10,056	2,798	7,258
4105213 Conventional		21	0218185213	05213	312025 WV014580 BURNS,	50,762	50,762		50,762	50,762	
4105219 Conventional		21	0218185219	05219	311968 WV014389 LINGER,	21,039	18,171	2,868	21,039	17,473	3,566
4105245 Conventional		21	0218185245	05245	311970 WV014391 REYNOLD	22,284	8,255	14,029	22,284	10,514	11,770
4105245 Conventional		21	0218185245	05245	312019 WV014584 LANCAST	23,015	23,015		23,015	23,015	

CNX Gas Company, LLC
Tax Year 7/1/15-6/30/16
Lewis County, WV

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNX State		CNX Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision		CNX Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNX		Property Tax Division Appraised Value	
						Appraised Value	Court Decision	Appraised Value	Decision		Appraised Value	Decision	Appraised Value	Difference
4105250 Conventional	21	0218185250	05250	312027	WV014582 LAWSON,	115,404	115,404	115,404	1		115,404	115,404	115,404	
4105258 Conventional	21	0218185258	05258	312032	WV014617 MEADER,	17,980	2,784	17,980	15,196		17,980	17,980	17,980	14,337
4105259 Conventional	21	0218185259	05259	312053	WV014618 MEADER,	16,739	1,129	16,739	15,610		16,739	16,739	16,739	14,216
4105260 Conventional	21	0218185260	05260	312054	WV014619 JOHN, H	53,748	29,421	53,748	24,327		53,748	53,748	53,748	4,962
4105289 Conventional	21	0218185289	05289	312089	WV014695 GIBSON,	9,980	500	9,980	9,480		9,980	9,980	9,980	9,480
4105318 Conventional	21	0218185318	05318	312030	WV014585 FISHER,	24,102	15,625	24,102	8,477		24,102	24,102	24,102	8,478
4105340 Conventional	21	0218185340	05340	312232	WV032749 MURRAY,	101,710	95,044	101,710	6,666		101,710	101,710	101,710	4,937
4104059 Conventional	21	0220000059	04059	309716	200711141 CARROL	6,016	500	6,016	5,516		6,016	6,016	6,016	5,516
4104060 Conventional	21	0220000060	04060	309717	200711142 CARROL	10,794	684	10,794	10,110		10,794	10,794	10,794	10,110
4104061 Conventional	21	0220000061	04061	309718	200711143 CARROL	8,710	500	8,710	8,210		8,710	8,710	8,710	8,210
4104062 Conventional	21	0220000062	04062	309714	200711139 KEGAN	9,624	500	9,624	9,124		9,624	9,624	9,624	9,124
4104065 Conventional	21	0220000065	04065	309715	200711140 FINSTE	6,838	500	6,838	6,338		6,838	6,838	6,838	6,338
4104069 Conventional	21	0220000069	04069	309715	200711145 FINSTE	10,977	500	10,977	10,477		10,977	10,977	10,977	10,477
4104098 Conventional	21	0220000098	04098	309744	200711180 FINSTE	32,263	29,233	32,263	3,030		32,263	32,263	32,263	3,029
4104029 Conventional	21	0220000029	04029	309316	200710260 USA 16	15,503	4,218	15,503	11,285		15,503	15,503	15,503	15,315
4104031 Conventional	21	0220000031	04031	309317	200710262 USA 83	10,962	500	10,962	10,462		10,962	10,962	10,962	10,462
4104032 Conventional	21	0220000032	04032	309318	200710263 USA 85	9,260	500	9,260	8,760		9,260	9,260	9,260	8,760
4104050 Conventional	21	0220000050	04050	309315	200710259 USA 11	16,894	500	16,894	16,394		16,894	16,894	16,894	16,394
4105025 Conventional	21	0220105025	05025	311974	WV014395 GILLOOL	8,769	1,353	8,769	7,416		8,769	8,769	8,769	7,416
4105243 Conventional	21	0220105243	05243	312026	WV014581 LAWSON,	82,181	82,180	82,181	1		82,181	82,181	82,181	
4105331 Conventional	21	0220105331	05331	312051	WV014616 HACKER,	75,540	75,539	75,540	1		75,540	75,540	75,540	
4105335 Conventional	21	0220105335	05335	309986	WV032683 BONNETT	46,208	38,318	46,208	7,890		46,208	46,208	46,208	3,764
4105336 Conventional	21	0220105336	05336	312230	WV032745 LAYFEL	31,773	24,605	31,773	7,168		31,773	31,773	31,773	4,776
4105337 Conventional	21	0220105337	05337	312231	WV032746 LAYFEL	38,397	38,396	38,397	1		38,397	38,397	38,397	
4105361 Conventional	21	0220105361	05361	312087	WV014693 GIBSON,	13,576	7,468	13,576	6,108		13,576	13,576	13,576	6,108
4105362 Conventional	21	0220105362	05362	312088	WV014694 GIBSON,	18,009	3,509	18,009	14,500		18,009	18,009	18,009	11,282
4105364 Conventional	21	0220105364	05364	312090	WV014696 GIBSON,	17,796	4,686	17,796	13,110		17,796	17,796	17,796	11,723
4105365 Conventional	21	0220105365	05365	312021	WV014576 HACKER,	13,152	6,854	13,152	6,298		13,152	13,152	13,152	6,299
4105366 Conventional	21	0220105366	05366	312022	WV014577 HACKER,	100,262	97,492	100,262	2,770		100,262	100,262	100,262	4,785
4105367 Conventional	21	0220105367	05367	312023	WV014578 HALL, P	103,961	94,159	103,961	9,802		103,961	103,961	103,961	4,728
4105367 Conventional	21	0220105367	05367	312023	WV014578 HALL, P	77,696	77,694	77,696	2		77,696	77,696	77,696	

CNX Gas Company, LLC
Tax Year 7/1/15-6/30/16
Lewis County, WV

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNX State Appraised Value	CNX Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNX Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNX Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Value Difference
4105396 Conventional	21	0220105396	05396	312097	WV014699 SKINNER	19,641	15,544	4,097	19,641	15,193	4,448
4105451 Conventional	21	0220105451	05451	310009	WV033242 SPONAU	81,057	76,341	4,716	81,057	76,565	4,492
4105469 Conventional	21	0220115469	05469	312126	WV014951 MUSCATE	80,775	66,140	14,635	80,775	76,121	4,654
4105467 Conventional	21	0220125467	05467	311967	WV014387 FURY, W	26,671	20,964	5,707	26,671	20,964	5,707
4105478 Conventional	21	0220125478	05478	312125	WV014950 MUSCATE	88,763	85,874	2,889	88,763	84,123	4,640
4105607 Conventional	21	0220125607	05607	310008	WV033083 BEACHLE	45,137	45,137	-	45,137	45,137	-
4105608 Conventional	21	0220125608	05608	310010	WV034977 BONNETT	113,508	101,677	11,831	113,508	108,041	4,467
4105615 Conventional	21	0220125615	05615	310011	WV034978 BONNETT	204,645	204,645	-	204,645	204,645	-
4109993 Conventional	21	0240000993	09993	317922	200710614 FINSTE	4,064	500	3,564	4,064	500	3,564
4104145 Conventional	21	0240004070	04145	309721	200711146 DEVANY	10,991	500	10,491	10,991	500	10,491
4104072 Conventional	21	0240004072	04072	309335	200710294 USA 17	8,051	500	7,551	8,051	500	7,551
4104073 Conventional	21	0240004073	04073	309332	200710291 USA 19	28,770	24,491	4,279	28,770	24,492	4,278
4104134 Conventional	21	0240004134	04134	309746	200711202 HITZPA	7,865	500	7,365	7,865	500	7,365
4104140 Conventional	21	0240004140	04140	309337	200710296 USA 10	3,266	500	2,766	3,266	500	2,766
4104150 Conventional	21	0240004150	04150	309747	200711203 HITZPA	12,195	974	11,221	12,195	974	11,221
4104155 Conventional	21	0240004155	04155	309339	200710298 USA 20	4,360	500	3,860	4,360	495	3,821
4104158 Conventional	21	0240004158	04158	309751	200711207 HITZPA	7,033	500	6,533	7,033	500	6,533
4104399 Conventional	21	0250000746	04399	311182	WVWY008463 IC	13,961	3,120	10,841	13,961	3,120	10,841
4101374 Conventional	21	0250001374	01374	314524	WVWY010687 IB	713	500	213	713	500	213
4101412 Conventional	21	0250001412	01412	314547	WVWY010745 IL	5,604	500	5,104	5,604	500	5,104
4101484 Conventional	21	0250001484	01484	314578	WVWY010831 IC	1,658	500	1,158	1,658	500	1,158
4101526 Conventional	21	0250001526	01526	314592	WVWY010887 IB	7,346	500	6,846	7,346	500	6,846
4101812 Conventional	21	0250001812	01812	314716	WVWY011381	10,599	500	10,099	10,599	500	10,099
4101857 Conventional	21	0250001857	01857	314731	WVWY011476	8,967	500	8,467	8,967	500	8,467
4101860 Conventional	21	0250001860	01860	314736	WVWY011455	5,586	500	5,086	5,586	500	5,086
4101870 Conventional	21	0250001870	01870	314746	WVWY011531 IS	4,527	500	4,027	4,527	500	4,027
4101881 Conventional	21	0250001881	01881	314745	WVWY011529	9,184	500	8,684	9,184	500	8,684
4101882 Conventional	21	0250001882	01882	311204	WVWY011526	55,261	55,261	-	55,261	55,261	-
4101897 Conventional	21	0250001897	01897	314756	WVWY011566	5,486	500	4,986	5,486	500	4,986
4101905 Conventional	21	0250001905	01905	314768	WVWY011644	4,032	500	3,532	4,032	500	3,532
4101911 Conventional	21	0250001911	01911	314757	WVWY011591	22,798	12,458	10,340	22,798	12,458	10,340

CNX Gas Company, LLC
Tax Year 7/1/15-6/30/16
Lewis County, WV

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNX State Appraised Value	CNX Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNX Value Difference	Property Tax		
									Division CNX Appraised Value	Supreme Court Decision	Property Tax Division Value Difference
4101936 Conventional		21	0250001936	01936	311206 WEWVT011662 (H	25,648	18,067	7,581	25,648	16,069	9,579
4101937 Conventional		21	0250001937	01937	314778 WEWVT011682	13,774	1,053	12,721	13,774	1,021	12,753
4101940 Conventional		21	0250001940	01940	314777 WEWVT011680	7,190	500	6,690	7,190	500	6,690
4101959 Conventional		21	0250001959	01959	314803 WEWVT011805	12,973	1,591	11,382	12,973	1,591	11,382
4101961 Conventional		21	0250001961	01961	311208 WEWVT011732	4,449	500	3,949	4,449	500	3,949
4101965 Conventional		21	0250001965	01965	314807 WEWVT011828	5,827	500	5,327	5,827	500	5,327
4101968 Conventional		21	0250001968	01968	314794 WEWVT011747	4,924	500	4,424	4,924	500	4,424
4101977 Conventional		21	0250001977	01977	314821 WEWVT011887	5,103	500	4,603	5,103	500	4,603
4101990 Conventional		21	0250001990	01990	309983 WEWVT011954	71,225	66,042	5,183	71,225	66,831	4,394
4101991 Conventional		21	0250001991	01991	314831 WEWVT011926	3,658	500	3,158	3,658	500	3,158
4101992 Conventional		21	0250001992	01992	309982 WEWVT011927	10,209	500	9,709	10,209	500	9,709
4101994 Conventional		21	0250001994	01994	309984 WEWVT011955	64,002	64,002		64,002	500	9,709
4102018 Conventional		21	0250002018	02018	314856 WEWVT012049	3,757	500	3,257	3,757	500	3,257
4102066 Conventional		21	0250002066	02066	314862 WEWVT012180	11,037	500	10,537	11,037	500	10,537
4102076 Conventional		21	0250002076	02076	311213 WEWVT012170	46,806	46,806		46,806	500	10,537
4102113 Conventional		21	0250002113	02113	313678 WEWVT003587 (E	6,907	500	6,407	6,907	500	6,407
4102163 Conventional		21	0250002163	02163	311214 WEWVT012245	26,537	18,307	8,230	26,537	18,308	8,229
4102179 Conventional		21	0250002179	02179	311219 WEWVT012447	7,136	500	6,636	7,136	500	6,636
4102189 Conventional		21	0250002189	02189	313520 WEWVT003322 (M	9,279	500	8,779	9,279	500	8,779
4102193 Conventional		21	0250002193	02193	313531 WEWVT008849 (P	18,942	8,788	10,154	18,942	8,788	10,154
4102198 Conventional		21	0250002199	02199	313555 WEWVT001444 (B	15,765	5,259	10,506	15,765	5,259	10,506
4102212 Conventional		21	0250002212	02212	313611 WEWVT002474 (R	1,630	500	1,130	1,630	500	1,130
4102223 Conventional		21	0250002223	02223	311142 WEWVT002707 (W	2,380	500	1,880	2,380	500	1,880
4102237 Conventional		21	0250002237	02237	315348 WV007017 ARNOLD,	46,601	46,601		46,601	500	1,880
4102245 Conventional		21	0250002245	02245	313679 WEWVT003601 (S	11,109	500	10,609	11,109	500	10,609
4102249 Conventional		21	0250002249	02249	311145 WEWVT003721 (T	18,841	9,507	9,334	18,841	9,506	9,335
4102261 Conventional		21	0250002261	02261	313711 WEWVT004134 (L	8,070	500	7,570	8,070	500	7,570
4102277 Conventional		21	0250002277	02277	313744 WEWVT004710 (T	10,551	500	10,051	10,551	500	10,051
4102295 Conventional		21	0250002295	02295	313872 WEWVT006594 (W	4,438	500	3,938	4,438	500	3,938
4102298 Conventional		21	0250002298	02298	311154 WEWVT007528 (B	7,204	500	6,704	7,204	500	6,704
4102376 Conventional		21	0250002376	02376	314078 WEWVT008459 (G	2,822	500	2,322	2,822	500	2,322

Formatted API	Well Type	CV	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNX State Appraised Value	CNX Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNX Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNX Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	Property Tax Division Value Difference
4103377 Conventional	21	0250002377	02377	314080 WFWVT008479 (L	12,638	1,093	11,545	12,638	1,326	11,312		
4103390 Conventional	21	0250002390	02390	317830 WFWVT011706 (E	2,046	500	1,546	2,046	500	1,546		
4103550 Conventional	21	0250002550	02550	311220 WFWVT012448	4,383	500	3,883	4,383	500	3,883		
4103587 Conventional	21	0250002587	02587	313543 WFWVT001138 (C	15,547	3,541	12,006	15,547	3,541	12,006		
4103699 Conventional	21	0250002699	02699	313802 WFWVT005787 (B	5,559	500	5,059	5,559	500	5,059		
4107710 Conventional	21	0250002710	02710	313519 WFWVT000313 (W	3,829	500	3,329	3,829	500	3,329		
4107289 Conventional	21	0260002789	02289	313783 WFWVT005447 (S	3,738	500	3,238	3,738	500	3,238		
4102694 Conventional	21	0260002694	02694	313574 WFWVT001872 (A	6,843	500	6,343	6,843	500	6,343		
4104279 Conventional	21	0270000479	04279	309768 2007111385 BRINK	31,807	28,446	3,361	31,807	28,446	3,361		
4104044 Conventional	21	0270000444	04044	309706 2007111129 NOLAN	10,794	500	10,294	10,794	500	10,294		
4102966 Conventional	21	0300002966	02966	309449 200710823 CURRY,	21,811	3,973	17,838	21,811	3,973	17,838		
4107881 Conventional	21	0300002881	02881	309692 2007111112 O'HARA	31,471	27,863	3,608	31,471	27,863	3,608		
4102955 Conventional	21	0300002955	02955	309448 200710822 CURRY,	8,713	500	8,213	8,713	500	8,213		
4103105 Conventional	21	0300003105	03105	309700 2007111120 SULLIV	81,977	81,094	883	81,977	81,094	883		
4103287 Conventional	21	0300003287	03287	309701 2007111121 TIERNE	23,111	11,579	11,532	23,111	11,579	11,532		
4103595 Conventional	21	0300003595	03595	309537 200710938 SIPLO	65,826	65,812	14	65,826	65,812	14		
4103632 Conventional	21	0300003632	03632	309545 200710947 ELIZAB	12,436	500	11,936	12,436	500	11,936		
4103652 Conventional	21	0300003652	03652	309552 200710954 BERRY	137,139	131,072	6,067	137,139	131,072	6,067		
4103660 Conventional	21	0300003660	03660	309546 200710949 TRAPP	27,089	14,116	12,973	27,089	14,116	12,973		
4103668 Conventional	21	0300003668	03668	309547 200710954 TRAPP	40,753	40,753		40,753	40,753			
4103697 Conventional	21	0300003697	03697	309567 200710972 CLEM 1	57,282	57,282		57,282	57,282			
4103704 Conventional	21	0300003704	03704	309564 200710969 LOSH 1	86,799	79,938	6,861	86,799	79,938	6,861		
4103738 Conventional	21	0300003738	03738	309565 200710970 LOSH 2	40,441	37,141	3,300	40,441	37,141	3,300		
4103745 Conventional	21	0300003745	03745	309573 200710979 HALL	28,575	21,569	6,956	28,575	21,569	6,956		
4103777 Conventional	21	0300003777	03777	309572 200710978 HALL	21,106	9,942	11,164	21,106	9,942	11,164		
4103778 Conventional	21	0300003778	03778	309574 200710980 KING 2	9,096	500	8,596	9,096	500	8,596		
4103779 Conventional	21	0300003779	03779	309482 200710863 CUMMIN	28,379	21,323	7,056	28,379	21,323	7,056		
4103807 Conventional	21	0300003807	03807	309453 200710827 FISHER	20,765	10,502	10,263	20,765	10,502	10,263		
4103808 Conventional	21	0300003808	03808	309568 200710973 KING 1	2,214	500	1,714	2,214	500	1,714		
				309369 200710504 CARPEN	33,581	31,516	2,065	33,581	31,516	2,065		
				309371 200710506 DENT	12,971	500	12,471	12,971	500	12,471		

CNX Gas Company, LLC
 Tax Year 7/1/15-6/30/16
 Lewis County, WV

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNX State Appraised Value	CNX Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNX Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNX Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Value Difference
4103829 Conventional	21	0300003829	03829	309370	200710505 SCOTT	25,967	16,083	9,884	12,705	7,863	5,813
4103845 Conventional	21	0300003845	03845	309372	200710509 WYANT	10,575	500	10,075	3,177	9,636	5,073
4103864 Conventional	21	0300003864	03864	309384	200710521 THOMPS	14,682	2,651	12,031	5,573	5,073	5,073
4103867 Conventional	21	0300003867	03867	309276	200710210 CONVEY	5,573	500	5,073	5,538	5,073	5,073
4103889 Conventional	21	0300003889	03889	309278	200710212 CNGP35	5,538	500	5,038	16,432	13,770	13,770
4103501 Conventional	21	0300020967	03501	311275	WV000967 KENNEY	16,432	500	15,932	11,537	3,404	8,133
4103485 Conventional	21	0300021058	03485	311279	WV001058 WALDECK	11,537	3,063	8,474	36,698	36,698	36,698
4103617 Conventional	21	0300021059	03617	311280	WV001059 WALDECK	36,698	36,698	9,020	25,194	16,174	9,020
4103484 Conventional	21	0300021060	03484	311281	WV001060 ROUGH/E	25,194	16,174	9,020	25,364	18,767	6,597
4103499 Conventional	21	0300021093	03499	311287	WV001093 WHITE	25,364	18,766	6,598	15,584	2,863	12,721
4103556 Conventional	21	0300021268	03556	311306	WV001268 CASEY H	15,584	2,863	12,721	21,942	13,278	8,664
4103569 Conventional	21	0300021270	03569	311307	WV001270 BUTCHER	21,942	13,278	8,664	6,757	500	6,257
4103503 Conventional	21	0300021536	03503	311288	WV001094 MERTZ	6,757	500	6,257	23,496	13,518	9,977
4103653 Conventional	21	0300021638	03653	311339	WV001638 ROUGH	23,496	13,519	9,977	4,326	500	3,826
4103673 Conventional	21	0300021640	03673	311341	WV001640 ROHRD	4,326	500	3,826	57,805	53,581	4,224
4103656 Conventional	21	0300021642	03656	311343	WV001642 DORSEY	57,805	52,573	5,232	33,347	21,119	12,228
4103600 Conventional	21	0300021644	03600	311345	WV001644 DEAN, W	33,347	21,121	12,226	16,284	500	15,784
4103647 Conventional	21	0300021648	03647	311348	WV001648 RASTLE	16,284	500	15,784	98,541	98,541	98,541
4103619 Conventional	21	0300021650	03619	311350	WV001650 ALFELD	98,541	39,296	59,245	39,296	39,296	39,296
4103606 Conventional	21	0300021655	03606	311346	WV001645 CASEY T	39,296	39,296	0	71,802	68,302	3,500
4103671 Conventional	21	0300021658	03671	311356	WV001657 BROWN	71,802	47,685	24,117	14,040	1,414	12,626
4103678 Conventional	21	0300022111	03678	311383	WV002111 JARVIS	14,040	1,414	12,626	26,852	18,814	8,038
4103678 Conventional	21	0300022135	03678	311385	WV002135 GUM, G	26,852	18,815	8,037	58,400	58,400	58,400
4103678 Conventional	21	0300022136	03678	311377	WV001958 ROHRBAU	58,400	58,400	0	48,112	48,112	48,112
4103507 Conventional	21	0300022773	03507	311429	WV002773 WHITE	48,112	48,111	1	36,974	35,919	1,055
4103825 Conventional	21	0300023507	03825	311276	WV000997 BUSH, C	36,974	35,922	1,052	13,604	7,134	6,470
4103649 Conventional	21	0300023825	03649	311432	WV002779 WHITE	13,604	7,134	6,470	42,047	34,952	7,095
4104046 Conventional	21	0310003649	04046	311372	WV001931 GUM, G	42,047	34,953	7,094	22,146	10,957	11,189
4103782 Conventional	21	0310004046	03782	309407	200710546 HALL T	22,146	14,366	7,780	54,370	54,370	54,370
4103782 Conventional	21	0310023559	03782	311428	WV002772 WHITE	54,370	54,370	0	28,618	26,085	2,533
4104353 Conventional	21	0310104353	04353	311581	WV005241 PETERSO	28,618	28,231	387			

CNX Gas Company, LLC
Tax Year 7/1/15-6/30/16
Lewis County, WV

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNX State Appraised Value	CNX Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNX Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNX Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Value Difference
4104375 Conventional	21	0310104375	04375	311585 WV005404	CAMDEN,	15,978	11,170	4,808	15,978	\$ 11,171	\$ 4,807
4104377 Conventional	21	0310104377	04377	311586 WV005405	CAMDEN	9,692	2,382	7,310	9,692	\$ 7,310	\$ 2,382
4104389 Conventional	21	0310104389	04389	311590 WV005425	FETTY,	5,564	500	5,064	5,564	\$ 500	\$ 5,064
4104390 Conventional	21	0310104390	04390	311593 WV005428	BENNETT	11,298	4,219	7,079	11,298	\$ 4,218	\$ 7,080
4104391 Conventional	21	0310104391	04391	311594 WV005429	HALL, R	18,781	9,418	9,363	18,781	\$ 9,418	\$ 9,363
4104392 Conventional	21	0310104392	04392	311592 WV005427	ROHRBAU	30,663	28,957	1,706	30,663	\$ 28,957	\$ 1,706
4104397 Conventional	21	0311114397	04397	311589 WV005424	CASEY,	44,405	38,761	5,644	44,405	\$ 38,763	\$ 5,642
4104404 Conventional	21	0311114404	04404	311591 WV005426	FETTY,	10,082	2,828	7,254	10,082	\$ 2,828	\$ 7,254
4104486 Conventional	21	0312124486	04486	311623 WV005673	HALL, R	39,716	31,204	8,512	39,716	\$ 31,204	\$ 8,512
4104489 Conventional	21	0312124489	04489	311624 WV005672	CUMMING	79,175	79,175	0	79,175	\$ 79,175	\$ 0
4104492 Conventional	21	0312124492	04492	311629 WV005690	DOORY,	28,651	28,651	0	28,651	\$ 28,651	\$ 0
4104493 Conventional	21	0312124493	04493	311628 WV005689	DOORY,	68,127	68,127	0	68,127	\$ 68,127	\$ 0
4104495 Conventional	21	0312124495	04495	311626 WV005674	PETERO	96,301	87,646	8,655	96,301	\$ 87,646	\$ 8,655
4104498 Conventional	21	0312124498	04498	311627 WV005675	PETERO	45,249	40,129	5,120	45,249	\$ 40,132	\$ 5,117
4104502 Conventional	21	0313134502	04502	311660 WV005898	ROHRBAU	132,496	132,496	0	132,496	\$ 132,496	\$ 0
4104503 Conventional	21	0313134503	04503	311661 WV005899	GUM, GR	61,873	35,728	26,145	61,873	\$ 35,728	\$ 26,145
4104505 Conventional	21	0313134505	04505	311570 WV005211	CAMDEN,	50,161	48,125	2,036	50,161	\$ 48,124	\$ 2,037
4104509 Conventional	21	0313134509	04509	311662 WV005903	GUM, GR	60,419	60,418	1	60,419	\$ 60,419	\$ 0
4104601 Conventional	21	0313134601	04601	311664 WV005903	DUNCAN,	39,016	25,261	13,755	39,016	\$ 25,261	\$ 13,755
4104591 Conventional	21	0314144591	04591	311685 WV005904	FETTY,	17,332	12,967	4,365	17,332	\$ 12,966	\$ 4,366
4104634 Conventional	21	0314144634	04634	311697 WV006202	GEORGE,	66,979	66,978	1	66,979	\$ 66,979	\$ 0
4104635 Conventional	21	0314144635	04635	311686 WV006191	WHITE,	17,841	4,804	13,037	17,841	\$ 5,481	\$ 12,360
4104636 Conventional	21	0314144636	04636	311687 WV006192	WHITE,	34,792	33,614	1,178	34,792	\$ 33,613	\$ 1,179
4104637 Conventional	21	0314144637	04637	311684 WV006188	ROHRBAU	51,844	50,868	976	51,844	\$ 50,871	\$ 973
4104638 Conventional	21	0314144638	04638	311685 WV006189	ROHRBAU	27,248	20,734	6,514	27,248	\$ 20,735	\$ 6,513
4104640 Conventional	21	0314144640	04640	311702 WV006213	FETTY,	13,873	1,362	12,511	13,873	\$ 1,362	\$ 12,511
4104641 Conventional	21	0314144641	04641	311690 WV006195	EGAN, A	26,123	18,893	7,230	26,123	\$ 18,893	\$ 7,230
4104642 Conventional	21	0314144642	04642	311688 WV006193	WHITE,	14,841	9,011	5,830	14,841	\$ 9,011	\$ 5,830
4104650 Conventional	21	0314144650	04650	311695 WV006200	PETERO	14,433	500	13,933	14,433	\$ 614	\$ 13,819
4104651 Conventional	21	0314144651	04651	311696 WV006201	JARVIS,	36,239	36,161	78	36,239	\$ 36,161	\$ 78
						44,148	44,147	1	44,148	\$ 44,148	\$ 0

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNK State Appraised Value	CNK Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNK Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNK Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Value Difference
4104659 Conventional	21	0314144659	04659	311691 WV006196	WOOFER	19,722	17,412	2,310	19,722	17,412	2,310
4104660 Conventional	21	0314144660	04660	311700 WV006211	JACKSON	183,067	149,371	33,696	183,067	179,622	3,445
4104661 Conventional	21	0314144661	04661	311701 WV006212	JACKSON	274,499	147,219	127,280	274,499	270,938	3,561
4104662 Conventional	21	0314144662	04662	311719 WV006253	CAMDEN	45,297	40,212	5,085	45,297	40,209	5,088
4104663 Conventional	21	0314144663	04663	311718 WV006252	CAMDEN	29,674	15,482	14,192	29,674	15,481	14,193
4104684 Conventional	21	0314144684	04684	311694 WV006199	HALL L	26,950	20,246	6,704	26,950	20,246	6,704
4104692 Conventional	21	0314144692	04692	311720 WV006254	CAMDEN	52,937	52,659	278	52,937	52,658	279
4104714 Conventional	21	0314144714	04714	311751 WV006344	CAMDEN	28,958	23,600	5,358	28,958	23,600	5,358
4104715 Conventional	21	0314144715	04715	311752 WV006345	CAMDEN	29,294	14,917	14,377	29,294	14,915	14,379
4104717 Conventional	21	0314144717	04717	311737 WV006315	S D CAM	30,249	25,782	4,467	30,249	25,782	4,467
4101917 Conventional	21	0315151917	01917	311757 WV006377	S D CAM	13,385	7,191	6,194	13,385	7,191	6,194
4104709 Conventional	21	0315154709	04709	311735 WV006313	CUMMING	12,308	5,632	6,676	12,308	5,631	6,677
4104710 Conventional	21	0315154710	04710	311738 WV006316	HATHAWA	8,377	1,084	7,293	8,377	1,084	7,293
4104711 Conventional	21	0315154711	04711	311739 WV006332	JARVIS	49,145	46,466	2,679	49,145	46,466	2,679
4104713 Conventional	21	0315154713	04713	311750 WV006343	CAMDEN	11,669	4,705	6,964	11,669	4,705	6,964
4104716 Conventional	21	0315154716	04716	311753 WV006346	CAMDEN	11,177	500	10,677	11,177	500	10,677
4104723 Conventional	21	0315154723	04723	311745 WV006338	CAMDEN	26,574	26,574		26,574	26,574	
4104724 Conventional	21	0315154724	04724	311754 WV006347	CAMDEN	15,724	10,752	4,972	15,724	10,751	4,973
4104725 Conventional	21	0315154725	04725	311748 WV006341	CAMDEN	10,785	3,632	7,153	10,785	3,631	7,154
4104726 Conventional	21	0315154726	04726	311749 WV006342	CAMDEN	14,881	9,359	5,522	14,881	9,359	5,522
4104728 Conventional	21	0315154728	04728	311746 WV006339	CAMDEN	29,804	15,681	14,123	29,804	15,679	14,125
4104729 Conventional	21	0315154729	04729	311747 WV006340	CAMDEN	29,120	14,657	14,463	29,120	14,654	14,466
4104730 Conventional	21	0315154730	04730	311740 WV006333	JARVIS	21,646	4,409	17,237	21,646	4,411	17,235
4104731 Conventional	21	0315154731	04731	311742 WV006335	CAMDEN	20,718	3,357	17,361	20,718	3,358	17,360
4104759 Conventional	21	0315154759	04759	311692 WV006197	WOOFER	20,312	18,012	2,300	20,312	18,013	2,299
4104781 Conventional	21	0315154781	04781	311773 WV006425	NICHOLA	13,885	1,844	12,041	13,885	1,843	12,042
4104782 Conventional	21	0315154782	04782	311774 WV006426	NICHOLA	20,096	18,082	2,014	20,096	18,082	2,014
4104800 Conventional	21	0315154800	04800	311776 WV006489	GL WHI	25,799	3,915	21,884	25,799	9,827	15,972
4104801 Conventional	21	0315154801	04801	311776 WV006490	BAILEY	19,550	17,104	2,446	19,550	17,104	2,446
4104803 Conventional	21	0315154803	04803	311777 WV006492	LOVETT	11,315	4,237	7,078	11,315	4,238	7,077
4104804 Conventional	21	0315154804	04804	311779 WV006494	LOVETT	10,398	3,189	7,209	10,398	3,189	7,209

CNK Gas Company, LLC
Tax Year 7/1/15-6/30/16
Lewis County, WV

Formatted API	Well type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	Appraised Value	Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNK Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNX Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Supreme Court Decision	Property Tax Division Value Difference
4104805 Conventional	21	0315154805	04805	311780 WV006495	J T LOV	11,129	500	10,629	11,129	500	10,629
4104806 Conventional	21	0315154806	04806	311786 WV006545	WHITE,	14,260	8,458	5,802	14,260	8,459	5,801
4104807 Conventional	21	0315154807	04807	311698 WV006205	NORRIS,	39,697	38,804	893	39,697	36,721	2,976
4104812 Conventional	21	0315154812	04812	311663 WV005902	CUMMING	44,932	39,619	5,313	44,932	39,617	5,315
4104822 Conventional	21	0315154822	04822	311762 WV006404	GROVER	17,314	13,378	3,936	17,314	13,379	3,935
4104829 Conventional	21	0315154829	04829	311765 WV006407	CASEY,	36,700	36,700		36,700	36,700	
4104830 Conventional	21	0315154830	04830	311767 WV006409	MARY A	12,426	12,426		12,426	5,803	6,623
4104831 Conventional	21	0315154831	04831	311787 WV006571	MERTZ,	41,271	41,271		41,271	41,271	
4104834 Conventional	21	0315154834	04834	311790 WV006589	CASEY,	37,669	27,933	9,736	37,669	27,933	9,736
4104836 Conventional	21	0315154836	04836	311792 WV006591	PIRIEST,	12,725	6,236	6,489	12,725	6,236	6,489
4104837 Conventional	21	0315154837	04837	311794 WV006601	MERTZ,	27,690	12,376	10,314	27,690	17,374	10,316
4104844 Conventional	21	0315154844	04844	311778 WV006499	AGGIE B	12,667	6,150	6,517	12,667	6,151	6,516
4104810 Conventional	21	0316164810	04810	311784 WV006499	H D BUT	9,949	2,676	7,273	9,949	2,676	7,273
4104811 Conventional	21	0316164811	04811	311785 WV006500	H D BUT	17,670	678	16,992	17,670	677	16,993
4104877 Conventional	21	0316164877	04877	311836 WV006717	CAMDEN,	8,263	1,007	7,256	8,263	1,006	7,257
4104879 Conventional	21	0316164879	04879	311838 WV006719	CAMDEN,	38,527	35,185	3,342	38,527	35,186	3,341
4104880 Conventional	21	0316164880	04880	311839 WV006720	CAMDEN,	16,774	12,486	4,288	16,774	12,486	4,288
4104881 Conventional	21	0316164881	04881	311840 WV006721	CAMDEN,	10,932	3,799	7,133	10,932	3,799	7,133
4104883 Conventional	21	0316164883	04883	311832 WV006712	WHITE,	19,311	15,777	3,534	19,311	14,530	4,781
4104884 Conventional	21	0316164884	04884	311833 WV006713	WHITE,	21,923	21,349	574	21,923	21,350	573
4104885 Conventional	21	0316164885	04885	311834 WV006714	BAILEY,	29,537	23,234	6,303	29,537	23,232	6,305
4104886 Conventional	21	0316164886	04886	311850 WV006792	CAMDEN,	9,090	1,694	7,396	9,090	1,694	7,396
4104890 Conventional	21	0316164890	04890	311835 WV006715	LOVETT,	46,046	35,341	10,705	46,046	46,046	
4104907 Conventional	21	0316164907	04907	311826 WV006637	KENNEY,	19,676	17,330	2,346	19,676	17,330	2,346
4104908 Conventional	21	0316164908	04908	311827 WV006638	KENNEY,	10,047	2,788	7,259	10,047	2,788	7,259
4104909 Conventional	21	0316164909	04909	311830 WV006643	ROHR, O	19,930	17,785	2,145	19,930	17,784	2,146
4104912 Conventional	21	0316164912	04912	311916 WV014130	MCHEMAR	9,118	1,727	7,391	9,118	1,727	7,391
4104913 Conventional	21	0316164913	04913	311880 WV008554	ROWE, B	30,036	25,423	4,613	30,036	25,422	4,614
4104914 Conventional	21	0316164914	04914	311881 WV008555	ROWE, B	21,417	20,445	972	21,417	20,445	972
4104924 Conventional	21	0316164924	04924	311744 WV006337	CAMDEN,	17,165	2,884	14,281	17,165	2,885	14,280
4104930 Conventional	21	0316164930	04930	311756 WV006369	CAMDEN,	14,834	9,291	5,543	14,834	9,290	5,544

CNG Gas Company, LLC
Tax Year 7/1/15-6/30/16
Lewis County, WV

Formatted API	Wad type	CV	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNK State Appraised Value	CNK Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNK Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNK Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Value Difference
4104940 Conventional	21	0316164940	04940	311758 WV006400 DENNISO	37,291	37,291	37,291	\$	37,291	\$	2,506
4104953 Conventional	21	0316164953	04953	311829 WV006642 ROUGH	28,462	28,462	28,462	\$	28,462	\$	
4105003 Conventional	21	0316165003	05003	311793 WV006592 DENNISO	24,490	24,490	24,490	\$	24,490	\$	
4105034 Conventional	21	0316165034	05034	311743 WV006336 CAMDEN	16,280	16,280	16,280	\$	16,280	\$	11,089
4104878 Conventional	21	0316164878	04878	311837 WV006718 CAMDEN	9,142	9,142	9,142	\$	9,142	\$	1,753
4104973 Conventional	21	0317174973	04973	309960 207346708 HOLDFEN	28,778	28,778	28,778	\$	28,778	\$	7,787
4104993 Conventional	21	0317174993	04993	311816 WV006626 WHITE	6,765	6,765	6,765	\$	6,765	\$	6,265
4105068 Conventional	21	0317175068	05068	317035 WV014590 KEMPER	80,350	80,350	80,350	\$	80,350	\$	
4105075 Conventional	21	0317175075	05075	317036 WV014591 NORRIS	63,895	63,895	63,895	\$	63,895	\$	
4105077 Conventional	21	0317175077	05077	317037 WV014592 NORRIS	20,490	20,490	20,490	\$	20,490	\$	1,704
4105154 Conventional	21	0317175154	05154	317038 WV014588 HALL, L	14,909	14,909	14,909	\$	14,909	\$	5,506
4105155 Conventional	21	0317175155	05155	317039 WV014589 HALL, L	65,266	65,266	65,266	\$	65,266	\$	8,296
4105082 Conventional	21	0318185082	05082	312037 WV014592 NORRIS	16,351	16,351	16,351	\$	16,351	\$	4,563
4105123 Conventional	21	0318185123	05123	312049 WV014611 SMITH	70,477	70,477	70,477	\$	70,477	\$	
4105144 Conventional	21	0318185144	05144	312055 WV014622 SMITH	39,182	39,182	39,182	\$	39,182	\$	
4105160 Conventional	21	0318185160	05160	309962 207361246 TRAPP	12,860	12,860	12,860	\$	12,860	\$	6,429
4105166 Conventional	21	0318185166	05166	312040 WV014600 WOOLTER	11,240	11,240	11,240	\$	11,240	\$	3,852
4105167 Conventional	21	0318185167	05167	312132 WV014604 HARRISO	50,402	50,402	50,402	\$	50,402	\$	2,881
4105180 Conventional	21	0318185180	05180	312041 WV014601 CAMDEN	30,681	30,681	30,681	\$	30,681	\$	2,584
4105187 Conventional	21	0318185187	05187	312038 WV014598 WOOLTER	19,373	19,373	19,373	\$	19,373	\$	8,867
4105188 Conventional	21	0318185188	05188	312039 WV014599 WOOLTER	59,185	59,185	59,185	\$	59,185	\$	2,890
4105195 Conventional	21	0318185195	05195	312056 WV014623 SMITH	23,010	23,010	23,010	\$	23,010	\$	6,586
4105196 Conventional	21	0318185196	05196	312057 WV014624 SMITH	12,507	12,507	12,507	\$	12,507	\$	6,510
4105197 Conventional	21	0318185197	05197	312058 WV014625 SMITH	10,792	10,792	10,792	\$	10,792	\$	7,153
4105208 Conventional	21	0318185208	05208	312059 WV014626 HUDKINS	45,321	45,321	45,321	\$	45,321	\$	
4105209 Conventional	21	0318185209	05209	312060 WV014627 HUDKINS	30,109	30,109	30,109	\$	30,109	\$	56
4105223 Conventional	21	0318185223	05223	312120 WV014840 WHITE	22,579	22,579	22,579	\$	22,579	\$	2,746
4105236 Conventional	21	0318185236	05236	311921 WV014135 HILL, M	20,565	20,565	20,565	\$	20,565	\$	4,323
					16,718	16,718	16,718	\$	16,718	\$	
					29,934	29,934	29,934	\$	29,934	\$	

CNK Gas Company, LLC
Tax Year 7/1/15-6/30/16
Lewis County, WV

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNK State Appraised Value	CNK Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNK Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNK Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Supreme Court Decision	Property Tax Division Value Difference
4105269 Conventional	21	0318185269	05269	312064	WV014633 BUTCHER	43,229	43,072	207	43,229	40,031	3,198
4105283 Conventional	21	0318185283	05283	311917	WV014131 HILL, M	37,858	37,858		37,858	37,858	
4105284 Conventional	21	0318185284	05284	311918	WV014132 HILL, M	73,686	73,686		73,686	73,686	
4105285 Conventional	21	0318185285	05285	311919	WV014133 HILL, M	89,974	89,974		89,974	89,974	
4105286 Conventional	21	0318185286	05286	311920	WV014134 HILL, M	100,455	100,455		100,455	100,455	
4105287 Conventional	21	0318185287	05287	311922	WV014136 HILL, M	92,322	92,322		92,322	92,322	
4105288 Conventional	21	0318185288	05288	311923	WV014137 HILL, M	70,232	70,232		70,232	70,232	
4102360 Conventional	21	0320007042	02360	311546	WV005020 BUTCHER	45,238	40,111	5,127	45,238	40,111	5,127
4102279 Conventional	21	0320007229	02279	311547	WV005022 T DDO	23,663	6,923	16,740	23,663	11,498	12,165
4103628 Conventional	21	0320009628	03628	311340	WV001639 CURTIS	12,720	500	12,220	12,720	500	12,220
4104105 Conventional	21	0320004105	04105	309411	200710550 LOHAN	29,822	11,458	18,364	21,814	16,414	5,400
4105319 Conventional	21	0320105319	05319	312031	WV014586 ALFRED	33,836	31,958	1,878	33,836	31,958	1,878
4105352 Conventional	21	0320105352	05352	312032	WV014587 ALFRED	51,500	51,499	1	51,500	51,500	
4105368 Conventional	21	0320105368	05368	312061	WV014628 NORRIS	71,021	71,019	2	71,021	71,021	
4105389 Conventional	21	0320105389	05389	312233	WV032764 BUTCHER	15,951	10,720	5,231	15,951	10,720	5,231
4105390 Conventional	21	0320105390	05390	312234	WV032765 NORRIS	40,304	38,209	2,095	40,304	38,209	2,095
4105391 Conventional	21	0320105391	05391	312242	WV032843 NORRIS	12,236	5,190	7,046	12,236	5,189	7,047
4105392 Conventional	21	0320105392	05392	312243	WV032842 NORRIS	21,398	19,939	1,459	21,398	19,931	1,467
4105419 Conventional	21	0320105419	05419	311925	WV014140 WHITE	56,766	54,615	2,151	56,766	53,099	3,667
4105586 Conventional	21	0320105586	05586	310007	WV032998 CUMMING	159,668	147,257	12,411	159,668	154,360	5,308
4105587 Conventional	21	0320105587	05587	310006	WV032997 CUMMING	85,827	74,437	11,390	85,827	81,316	4,511
4105458 Conventional	21	0320115458	05458	311924	WV014138 MORRIS	34,361	24,745	9,616	34,361	29,849	4,512
4105488 Conventional	21	0320115488	05488	312254	WV032896 DOORY	27,600	22,527	5,073	27,600	22,526	5,074
4105490 Conventional	21	0320115490	05490	312256	WV032898 ALFRED	23,570	12,823	10,747	23,570	13,153	10,417
4105496 Conventional	21	0320115496	05496	312257	WV032901 CASEY	30,287	23,498	6,789	30,287	23,967	6,320
4105497 Conventional	21	0320115497	05497	312259	WV032906 WALDECK	48,506	48,506		48,506	48,506	
4105525 Conventional	21	0320115525	05525	312255	WV032897 DOORY	27,549	22,441	5,108	27,549	22,440	5,109
4105527 Conventional	21	0320115527	05527	312263	WV032961 WHITE	63,645	63,645		63,645	63,645	
4105545 Conventional	21	0320115545	05545	310003	WV032986 ROHRBAU	74,557	74,557		74,557	74,557	
4105546 Conventional	21	0320115546	05546	310004	WV032987 ROHRBAU	28,291	23,686	4,605	28,291	23,687	4,604
4105547 Conventional	21	0320115547	05547	310005	WV032988 ROHRBAU	63,294	63,294		63,294	63,294	

CNX Gas Company, LLC
Tax Year 7/1/15-6/30/16
Lewis County, WV

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNX State Appraised Value	CNX Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNX Value Difference	Property Tax Division Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Appraised Value
4105548 Conventional	21	0320115548	05548	309866	207404034 ROHRBA	101,565	73,121	28,444	101,565	98,236	3,329
4105549 Conventional	21	0320115549	05549	309867	207404036 ROHRBA	74,047	16,643	7,404	24,047	16,643	7,404
4105555 Conventional	21	0320115555	05555	309864	207404009 CLEM	98,260	98,260		98,260	98,260	
4105556 Conventional	21	0320115556	05556	309863	207404007 CLEM	60,074	60,074		60,074	60,074	
4105560 Conventional	21	0320125560	05560	310002	WV032983 HALL, L	32,420	30,812	1,608	32,420	30,812	1,607
4105562 Conventional	21	0320125562	05562	310001	WV032981 HALL, L	54,307	54,307		54,307	54,307	
4105598 Conventional	21	0320125598	05598	310000	WV032980 HALL, L	55,027	55,027	1	55,027	55,027	
4105600 Conventional	21	0320125600	05600	312264	WV032974 BAILEY,	63,125	63,125		63,125	63,125	
4105601 Conventional	21	0320125601	05601	312265	WV032975 MEINER	63,122	63,122	1	63,122	63,122	
4105605 Conventional	21	0320125605	05605	312258	WV032902 CASEY,	34,010	28,930	5,080	34,010	27,034	6,976
4105612 Conventional	21	0320125612	05612	312261	WV032910 ROUGH,	77,458	69,936	7,522	77,458	71,298	6,160
4105613 Conventional	21	0320125613	05613	312262	WV032911 ROHR, O	32,270	28,520	3,750	32,270	27,075	5,195
4105633 Conventional	21	0320125633	05633	312266	WV033012 ROUGH,	23,246	15,350	7,896	23,246	15,350	7,896
4105634 Conventional	21	0320125634	05634	312267	WV033013 ROUGH,	61,895	61,894	1	61,895	61,895	
4105635 Conventional	21	0320125635	05635	312268	WV033014 ROUGH,	40,799	40,799		40,799	40,799	
4105638 Conventional	21	0320135638	05638	312189	WV031221 BENNETT	20,231	10,672	9,559	20,231	10,673	9,558
4105639 Conventional	21	0320135639	05639	312341	WV0334623 BENNETT	161,701	161,700	1	161,701	161,701	
4105645 Conventional	21	0320135645	05645	312190	WV031222 BENNETT	43,443	43,443		43,443	43,443	
4105646 Conventional	21	0320135646	05646	312342	WV0334626 BENNETT	69,067	63,974	5,093	69,067	63,967	5,100
4105518 Conventional	21	0330003518	03518	311298	WV001232 ROUGH,E	97,128	97,127	1	97,128	97,128	
4103575 Conventional	21	0330003575	03575	311323	WV001536 MERTZ,M	16,945	4,400	12,545	16,945	4,399	12,546
4103599 Conventional	21	0330003599	03599	311347	WV001646 CASEY H	6,102	500	5,602	6,102	500	5,602
4103607 Conventional	21	0330003607	03607	311352	WV001659 CASEY H	27,206	21,865	5,341	27,206	21,863	5,343
4103610 Conventional	21	0330003610	03610	311352	WV001652 ROUGH,E	17,884	13,864	4,020	17,884	13,864	4,020
4103611 Conventional	21	0330003611	03611	311351	WV001651 ROUGH,	35,924	25,163	10,761	35,924	25,165	10,759
4103612 Conventional	21	0330003612	03612	311342	WV001641 ROHR,D	35,894	25,118	10,776	35,894	25,118	10,776
4103613 Conventional	21	0330003613	03613	311349	WV001649 CASEY,T	9,925	500	9,429	9,925	500	9,429
4103627 Conventional	21	0330003627	03627	311357	WV001658 BROWN,	11,574	500	11,074	11,574	500	11,074
4103635 Conventional	21	0330003635	03635	311338	WV001637 WALDECK	15,748	500	15,248	15,748	500	15,248
4103641 Conventional	21	0330003641	03641	311354	WV001655 CASEY,T	11,629	1,396	10,233	11,629	937	10,692
						17,202	500	16,702	17,202	500	16,702

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNX State Appraised Value	CNX Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNX Value Difference	Property Tax Division Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Appraised Value Difference	Property Tax Division Value
4103671	Conventional	21	0330003671	03671	311344 WV001643 KRAUS, L	29,451	4,314	25,137	29,451	\$ 22,778	\$ 6,673
4103683	Conventional	21	0330003683	03683	311384 WV002127 GUIM, G	24,937	15,767	9,170	24,937	\$ 15,767	\$ 9,170
4103710	Conventional	21	0330003710	03710	311386 WV002136 ROHRBAU	40,064	40,064		40,064	\$ 40,064	\$
4103725	Conventional	21	0330003725	03725	311355 WV001656 BFACH, A	16,909	12,810	4,159	16,909	\$ 12,809	\$ 4,160
4103784	Conventional	21	0330003784	03784	311431 WV002775 ROHRBAU	26,642	18,476	8,166	26,642	\$ 18,476	\$ 8,166
4103785	Conventional	21	0330003785	03785	311430 WV002774 ROHRBAU	40,383	40,383		40,383	\$ 40,383	\$
4103826	Conventional	21	0330003826	03826	311433 WV002780 WHITE,	111,073	111,073		111,073	\$ 111,073	\$
4104086	Conventional	21	0330004086	04086	309413 200710552 JARVIS	20,337	10,164	10,373	15,212	\$ 7,783	\$ 7,941
4104103	Conventional	21	0330004103	04103	309410 200710559 HALL, C	18,997	3,388	15,609	19,561	\$ 1,746	\$ 10,809
4104119	Conventional	21	0330004119	04119	311224 KEMPER 1 WV13075	15,843	1,932	13,511	9,070	\$ 1,011	\$ 5,063
4104126	Conventional	21	0330004126	04126	309418 200710557 KERRIG	22,872	12,572	10,300	21,511	\$ 9,028	\$ 7,887
4104143	Conventional	21	0330004143	04143	309424 200710565 CONNOL	26,071	17,568	8,503	19,561	\$ 3,431	\$ 6,510
4100036	Conventional	21	0350000036	00036	314074 WEWVT008384 (W)	5,193	500	4,693	5,193	\$ 500	\$ 4,693
4100042	Conventional	21	0350000042	00042	311174 WEWVT008385 (W)	5,380	500	4,880	5,380	\$ 500	\$ 4,880
4100063	Conventional	21	0350000063	00063	311186 WEWVT008634 (K)	28,285	24,832	3,453	28,285	\$ 24,832	\$ 3,453
4100089	Conventional	21	0350000089	00089	314141 WEWVT008874 (C)	16,217	4,350	11,867	16,217	\$ 4,350	\$ 11,867
4100163	Conventional	21	0350000163	00163	313705 WEWVT004028 (C)	8,347	500	7,847	8,347	\$ 500	\$ 7,847
4100796	Conventional	21	0350000796	00796	314389 WEWVT010333 (W)	6,061	500	5,561	6,061	\$ 500	\$ 5,561
4100802	Conventional	21	0350000802	00802	314390 WEWVT010334 (R)	5,960	500	5,460	5,960	\$ 500	\$ 5,460
4100857	Conventional	21	0350000857	00857	314398 WEWVT010351 (R)	2,499	500	1,999	2,499	\$ 500	\$ 1,999
4100858	Conventional	21	0350000858	00858	314399 WEWVT010352 (R)	7,471	500	6,971	7,471	\$ 500	\$ 6,971
4100895	Conventional	21	0350000895	00895	311190 WEWVT010358 (C)	1,374	500	874	1,374	\$ 500	\$ 874
4100912	Conventional	21	0350000912	00912	314402 WEWVT010357 (H)	4,424	500	3,924	4,424	\$ 500	\$ 3,924
4100992	Conventional	21	0350000992	00992	314417 WEWVT010388 (L)	23,427	18,649	4,778	23,427	\$ 18,649	\$ 4,778
4101113	Conventional	21	0350001113	01113	314455 WEWVT010463 (L)	4,835	500	4,335	4,835	\$ 500	\$ 4,335
4101114	Conventional	21	0350001114	01114	314453 WEWVT010461 (W)	9,004	500	8,504	9,004	\$ 500	\$ 8,504
4101119	Conventional	21	0350001119	01119	314450 WEWVT010457 (W)	8,569	500	8,069	8,569	\$ 500	\$ 8,069
4101126	Conventional	21	0350001126	01126	314452 WEWVT010460 (C)	17,491	7,544	9,947	17,491	\$ 7,545	\$ 9,946
4101273	Conventional	21	0350001273	01273	314488 WEWVT010546 (C)	6,766	500	6,266	6,766	\$ 500	\$ 6,266
4101279	Conventional	21	0350001279	01279	314453 WEWVT008206 (W)	10,636	500	10,136	10,636	\$ 500	\$ 10,136
4101290	Conventional	21	0350001290	01290	314483 WEWVT010539 (F)	2,444	500	1,944	2,444	\$ 500	\$ 1,944

CNK Gas Company, LLC
Tax Year 7/1/15-6/30/16
Lewis County, WV

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNK State Appraised Value	CNK Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNK Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNK Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Supreme Court Decision	Property Tax Division Value Difference
4101411 Conventional	21	0350001411	01411	314539 WEWVT010731	3,916	500	3,416	3,916	500	500	3,416
4101458 Conventional	21	0350001458	01458	309971 WEWVT010795	8,893	500	8,393	8,893	500	500	8,393
4101582 Conventional	21	0350001582	01582	314616 WEWVT010944	25,132	20,510	4,622	25,132	20,510	20,510	4,622
4101596 Conventional	21	0350001596	01596	309972 WEWVT010986	9,309	500	8,809	9,309	500	500	8,809
4101604 Conventional	21	0350001604	01604	314631 WEWVT010994	19,992	11,129	8,863	19,992	11,129	11,129	8,863
4101656 Conventional	21	0350001656	01656	311161 WEWVT008203	22,677	14,431	8,246	22,677	14,431	14,431	8,246
4101670 Conventional	21	0350001670	01670	309975 WEWVT011151	31,324	31,287	37	31,324	31,287	31,287	37
4101674 Conventional	21	0350001674	01674	311198 WEWVT011158	11,593	1,319	10,274	11,593	1,319	1,319	10,274
4101681 Conventional	21	0350001681	01681	311197 WEWVT011138 (C)	4,321	500	3,821	4,321	500	500	3,821
4101694 Conventional	21	0350001694	01694	311196 WEWVT011134	111,148	111,146	2	111,148	111,146	111,146	2
4101742 Conventional	21	0350001742	01742	314686 WEWVT011217	61,889	61,888	1	61,889	61,888	61,888	1
4101745 Conventional	21	0350001745	01745	314697 WEWVT011261	11,993	1,664	10,329	11,993	1,664	1,664	10,329
4101746 Conventional	21	0350001746	01746	311139 WEWVT002248	118,964	118,964	-	118,964	118,964	118,964	-
4101759 Conventional	21	0350001759	01759	314058 WEWVT008235 (C)	7,265	500	6,765	7,265	500	500	6,765
4101804 Conventional	21	0350001804	01804	313841 WEWVT006256 (B)	1,401	500	901	1,401	500	500	901
4101845 Conventional	21	0350001845	01845	314072 WEWVT008359 (K)	13,256	1,337	11,919	13,256	1,337	1,337	11,919
4101849 Conventional	21	0350001849	01849	314728 WEWVT011462	8,629	500	8,129	8,629	500	500	8,129
4101850 Conventional	21	0350001850	01850	314729 WEWVT011466	18,390	6,413	11,977	18,390	6,413	6,413	11,977
4101856 Conventional	21	0350001856	01856	309979 WEWVT011483	25,528	20,321	5,207	25,528	20,321	20,321	5,207
4101861 Conventional	21	0350001861	01861	311203 WEWVT011465 (W)	10,206	500	9,706	10,206	500	500	9,706
4101872 Conventional	21	0350001872	01872	314748 WEWVT011534	50,512	50,511	1	50,512	50,511	50,511	1
4101901 Conventional	21	0350001901	01901	314753 WEWVT011550 (W)	7,474	500	6,974	7,474	500	500	6,974
4101927 Conventional	21	0350001927	01927	314776 WEWVT011668	59,696	59,696	-	59,696	59,696	59,696	-
4101941 Conventional	21	0350001941	01941	311207 WEWVT011707 (R)	5,779	500	5,279	5,779	500	500	5,279
4101993 Conventional	21	0350001993	01993	314837 WEWVT011937 (W)	7,717	500	7,217	7,717	500	500	7,217
4102017 Conventional	21	0350002017	02017	311171 WEWVT008365 (U)	2,204	500	1,704	2,204	500	500	1,704
4102040 Conventional	21	0350002040	02040	311223 WEWVT012938	13,859	1,284	12,575	13,859	1,284	1,284	12,575
4102148 Conventional	21	0350002148	02148	314898 WEWVT012311	24,497	15,067	9,430	24,497	15,067	15,067	9,430
4102197 Conventional	21	0350002197	02197	313550 WEWVT001245 (K)	8,993	500	8,493	8,993	500	500	8,493
4102198 Conventional	21	0350002198	02198	313551 WEWVT001259 (D)	3,310	500	2,810	3,310	500	500	2,810
4102219 Conventional	21	0350002219	02219	313620 WEWVT002634 (B)	2,321	500	1,821	2,321	500	500	1,821

CNX Gas Company, LLC
Tax Year 7/1/15-6/30/16
Lewis County, WV

Formatted API	Well Type	CV	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNX State Appraised Value	CNX Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNX Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNX Appraised Value	Property Tax Division CNX Appraised Value	Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	Property Tax Division Value	Property Tax Division Value
4102231	Conventional	21	0350002231	02231	313636 WEWVT002955 (S	6,092	500	5,592	6,092	6,092	500	5,592	5,592
4102238	Conventional	21	0350002238	02238	313652 WEWVT003278 (B	4,442	500	3,942	4,442	4,442	500	3,942	3,942
4102253	Conventional	21	0350002253	02253	313698 WEWVT003900 (R	532	500	32	532	532	500	32	32
4102256	Conventional	21	0350002256	02256	313702 WEWVT003935 (R	5,614	500	5,114	5,614	5,614	500	5,114	5,114
4102259	Conventional	21	0350002259	02259	313708 WEWVT004103 (D	3,033	500	2,533	3,033	3,033	500	2,533	2,533
4102300	Conventional	21	0350002300	02300	313972 WEWVT007824 (L	1,291	500	791	1,291	1,291	500	791	791
4102301	Conventional	21	0350002301	02301	313973 WEWVT007875 (A	10,193	500	9,693	10,193	10,193	500	9,693	9,693
4102312	Conventional	21	0350002312	02312	314052 WEWVT008198 (W	1,472	500	972	1,472	1,472	500	972	972
4102317	Conventional	21	0350002317	02317	311163 WEWVT008270 (F	13,748	1,810	11,938	13,748	13,248	1,809	11,439	11,439
4102318	Conventional	21	0350002318	02318	311164 WEWVT008221 (F	2,812	500	2,312	2,812	2,812	500	2,312	2,312
4102326	Conventional	21	0350002326	02326	311166 WEWVT008236 (C	9,335	500	8,835	9,335	9,335	500	8,835	8,835
4102327	Conventional	21	0350002327	02327	314059 WEWVT008251 (C	6,396	500	5,896	6,396	6,396	500	5,896	5,896
4102329	Conventional	21	0350002329	02329	314061 WEWVT008261 (M	15,240	3,886	11,354	15,240	15,240	3,887	11,353	11,353
4102332	Conventional	21	0350002332	02332	314062 WEWVT008278 (G	4,633	500	4,133	4,633	4,633	500	4,133	4,133
4102335	Conventional	21	0350002335	02335	314063 WEWVT008286 (B	7,133	500	6,633	7,133	7,133	500	6,633	6,633
4102338	Conventional	21	0350002338	02338	314064 WEWVT008294 (N	14,073	2,649	11,424	14,073	14,073	2,647	11,426	11,426
4102348	Conventional	21	0350002348	02348	319385 WEWVT008336 (W	1,972	500	1,472	1,972	1,972	500	1,472	1,472
4102349	Conventional	21	0350002349	02349	311170 WEWVT008338 (W	1,051	500	551	1,051	1,051	500	551	551
4102351	Conventional	21	0350002351	02351	314066 WEWVT008342 (H	3,684	500	3,184	3,684	3,684	500	3,184	3,184
4102353	Conventional	21	0350002353	02353	314069 WEWVT008351 (S	1,903	500	1,403	1,903	1,903	500	1,403	1,403
4102354	Conventional	21	0350002354	02354	314071 WEWVT008357 (D	17,499	7,557	9,942	17,499	17,499	7,556	9,943	9,943
4102355	Conventional	21	0350002355	02355	314073 WEWVT008364 (R	13,854	1,813	12,041	13,854	13,854	1,812	12,042	12,042
4102357	Conventional	21	0350002357	02357	311172 WEWVT008366 (J	6,587	500	6,087	6,587	6,587	500	6,087	6,087
4102359	Conventional	21	0350002359	02359	311173 WEWVT008379 (P	2,063	500	1,563	2,063	2,063	500	1,563	1,563
4102363	Conventional	21	0350002363	02363	311176 WEWVT008412 (L	511	500	11	511	511	500	11	11
4102364	Conventional	21	0350002364	02364	311177 WEWVT008413 (R	9,337	500	8,837	9,337	9,337	500	8,837	8,837
4102371	Conventional	21	0350002371	02371	311178 WEWVT008433 (R	4,561	500	4,061	4,561	4,561	500	4,061	4,061
4102381	Conventional	21	0350002381	02381	314177 WEWVT008817 (M	3,668	500	3,168	3,668	3,668	500	3,168	3,168
4102382	Conventional	21	0350002382	02382	311187 WEWVT008818 (L	4,251	500	3,751	4,251	4,251	500	3,751	3,751
4102332	Conventional	21	0350002332	02332	314920 WEWVT012525 (C	79,080	79,080		79,080	79,080	79,080		
4102698	Conventional	21	0350002698	02698	314057 WEWVT008731 (C	2,048	500	1,548	2,048	2,048	500	1,548	1,548

CNX Gas Company, LLC
Tax Year 7/1/15-6/30/16
Lewis County, WV

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNX State Appraised Value	CNX Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNX Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNX Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Difference
4102700 Conventional		21	0350002700	02700	311165 WEWVT008234 (C	8,857	500	8,357	8,857	500	8,357
4102703 Conventional		21	0350002703	02703	314065 WEWVT008339 (P	12,249	1,452	10,797	12,249	1,452	10,797
4102705 Conventional		21	0350002705	02705	314056 WEWVT008216 (F	3,612	500	3,112	3,612	500	3,112
4102706 Conventional		21	0350002706	02706	313735 WEWVT004560 (F	4,886	500	4,386	4,886	500	4,386
4102707 Conventional		21	0350002707	02707	313617 WEWVT002482 (W	5,400	500	4,900	5,400	500	4,900
4102711 Conventional		21	0350002711	02711	314060 WEWVT008260 (M	10,217	500	9,717	10,217	500	9,717
4102713 Conventional		21	0350002713	02713	311175 WEWVT008386 (W	7,792	500	7,292	7,792	500	7,292
4102714 Conventional		21	0350002714	02714	314055 WEWVT008214 (B	11,176	500	10,676	11,176	500	10,676
4102716 Conventional		21	0350002716	02716	311179 WEWVT008434 (R	3,123	500	2,623	3,123	500	2,623
4102717 Conventional		21	0350002717	02717	314076 WEWVT008443 (W	6,002	500	5,502	6,002	500	5,502
4102720 Conventional		21	0350002720	02720	314067 WEWVT008349 (S	9,258	500	8,758	9,258	500	8,758
4102721 Conventional		21	0350002721	02721	313670 WEWVT003462 (J	6,778	500	6,278	6,778	500	6,278
4102728 Conventional		21	0350002728	02728	314058 WEWVT008350 (S	6,491	500	5,991	6,491	500	5,991
4102316 Conventional		21	0360002316	02316	311162 WEWVT008219 (F	14,371	4,051	10,320	14,371	3,569	10,802
4103280 Conventional		21	0360003280	03280	309433 200710658 GISSY	2,187	500	1,687	2,187	473	1,597
4101655 Conventional		21	0370001655	01655	314070 WEWVT008354 (B	15,657	3,076	12,581	15,657	3,541	12,116
4101906 Conventional		21	0370001906	01906	311205 WEWVT011565 (W	16,664	8,101	8,563	16,664	6,427	10,237
4102342 Conventional		21	0370002342	02342	311169 WEWVT008310 (W	17,350	9,214	8,136	17,350	7,339	10,011
4102372 Conventional		21	0370002372	02372	311181 WEWVT008450 (W	9,642	500	9,142	9,642	500	9,142
4102712 Conventional		21	0370002712	02712	311180 WEWVT008448 (W	8,783	500	8,283	8,783	500	8,283
4103324 Conventional		21	0370003324	03324	309223 200710101 OSBORN	11,010	500	10,510	11,010	500	10,510
4104057 Conventional		21	0370004057	04057	309408 200710547 HALL T	13,221	612	12,609	13,221	383	9,740
4104063 Conventional		21	0370004063	04063	309412 200710551 HALL C	25,211	17,401	7,810	25,211	13,223	5,980
4104104 Conventional		21	0370004104	04104	309417 200710556 HALL C	24,853	12,248	12,605	24,853	5,237	9,442
4104121 Conventional		21	0370004121	04121	309422 200710562 KERRIG	25,661	6,073	17,588	25,661	1,114	9,315
4104133 Conventional		21	0370004133	04133	311574 WV005215 CAMDEN,	89,952	89,952	1,522	89,952	29,114	3,200
4104324 Conventional		21	0380004324	04324	311571 WV005212 CAMDEN,	4,986	500	4,486	4,986	500	4,486
4104328 Conventional		21	0380004328	04328	311572 WV005213 CAMDEN,	18,313	5,721	12,592	18,313	6,693	11,620
4104329 Conventional		21	0380004329	04329	311573 WV005214 CAMDEN,	11,203	4,110	7,093	11,203	4,110	7,093
4104348 Conventional		21	0390004348	04348	311580 WV005240 CUMMING	18,135	14,735	3,400	18,135	14,735	3,400
4104352 Conventional		21	0390004352	04352							

CNX Gas Company, LLC
Tax Year 7/1/15-6/30/16
Lewis County, WV

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNX State Appraised Value	CNX Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNX Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNX Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Value Difference
4101045 Conventional	21	0400001045	03038	309680	200711100 FULLER	5,448	500	4,948	5,448	500	4,948
4103038 Conventional	21	0400003038	03038	309704	200711124 WHITE	14,180	1,286	12,894	14,180	1,515	12,665
4103089 Conventional	21	0400003089	03089	309460	200710835 RINEHA	54,834	54,833	1	54,834	54,834	-
4103296 Conventional	21	0400003296	03296	309681	200711101 FULLER	14,713	2,681	12,031	14,713	2,681	12,032
4103297 Conventional	21	0400003297	03297	309682	200711102 FULLER	13,247	1,331	11,916	13,247	1,330	11,917
4103426 Conventional	21	0400003426	03426	309472	200710852 GOULD	57,585	57,584	1	57,585	57,585	-
4103476 Conventional	21	0400003476	03476	309519	200710916 GARTON	1,609	500	1,109	1,609	500	1,109
4103486 Conventional	21	0400003486	03486	309249	200710146 ROHR 2	15,472	2,667	12,805	15,472	2,793	12,679
4103508 Conventional	21	0400003508	03508	309251	200710155 ROHR 5	1,914	500	1,414	1,914	500	1,414
4103669 Conventional	21	0400003669	03669	309544	200710946 WESTON	9,865	500	9,365	9,865	500	9,365
4103736 Conventional	21	0400003736	03736	309258	200710177 RIGGS/	6,515	500	6,015	6,515	500	6,015
4103828 Conventional	21	0400003828	03828	309390	200710517 GUM, 1	7,920	500	7,420	7,920	500	7,420
4103850 Conventional	21	0400003850	03850	309376	200710513 GARTON	14,527	2,495	12,032	14,527	2,495	12,032
4103852 Conventional	21	0400003852	03852	309375	200710512 HALL	19,181	8,203	10,978	19,181	8,203	10,978
4103871 Conventional	21	0400003871	03871	309396	200710533 SCOTT	41,791	41,790	1	41,791	41,791	-
4103885 Conventional	21	0400003885	03885	309397	200710534 RINEHA	25,033	17,109	7,924	25,033	17,109	7,924
4103894 Conventional	21	0400003894	03894	309461	200710836 GOULD	29,857	25,121	4,736	29,857	25,121	4,736
4103897 Conventional	21	0400003897	03897	311557	WW005041 WOODFOR	70,016	70,016	-	70,016	70,016	-
4103898 Conventional	21	0400003898	03898	311558	WW005042 EDMISTO	47,135	47,135	-	47,135	47,135	-
4103899 Conventional	21	0400003899	03899	311559	WW005043 BENNETT	89,699	89,698	1	89,699	89,699	-
4103900 Conventional	21	0400003900	03900	311560	WW005044 GOULD	65,804	65,804	-	65,804	65,804	-
4103901 Conventional	21	0400003901	03901	311561	WW005045 UNION N	101,939	101,939	-	101,939	101,939	-
4103902 Conventional	21	0400003902	03902	311551	WW005029 BUTCHER	35,154	23,950	11,204	35,154	23,950	11,204
4103903 Conventional	21	0400003903	03903	311473	WW002959 STACHE	2,527	2,527	-	2,527	2,527	-
4103904 Conventional	21	0400003904	03904	311529	200710359 KOLB 1	11,046	500	10,546	11,046	500	10,546
4103905 Conventional	21	0400003905	03905	309913	200711832 GSM 3	11,895	1,626	10,269	11,895	1,626	10,269
4103906 Conventional	21	0400003906	03906	309914	200711833 GEBRUD	2,610	500	2,110	2,610	500	2,110
4104000 Conventional	21	0400004000	04000	311613	WW005652 SWISHER	55,958	55,958	-	55,958	55,958	-
4104001 Conventional	21	0400004001	04001	311620	WW005659 LAWSON,	43,461	43,461	-	43,461	43,461	-
4104002 Conventional	21	0400004002	04002	311622	WW005661 LAWSON,	78,448	46,736	31,712	78,448	46,736	31,712
4104003 Conventional	21	0400004003	04003	311614	WW005653 SUTTON,	25,679	18,165	7,514	25,679	18,165	7,514

CNK Gas Company, LLC
 Tax Year 7/1/15-6/30/16
 Lewis County, WV

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNK State Appraised Value	CNK Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNK Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNK Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Appraised Value	Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	Property Tax Division Value Difference
4104481 Conventional	21	0412124481	04481	311616 WV005655	SUTTON,	92,815	92,814	1	92,815	92,815	\$	\$
4104483 Conventional	21	0412124483	04483	311618 WV005657	HALL, M	113,386	110,040	3,346	113,386	113,386	\$	108,294 \$
4104480 Conventional	21	0412124486	04480	311615 WV005654	SUTTON,	142,851	142,850	1	142,851	142,851	\$	142,851 \$
4104490 Conventional	21	0412124490	04490	311619 WV005658	ALLMAN,	84,202	84,200	2	84,202	84,202	\$	84,202 \$
4104491 Conventional	21	0412124491	04491	311637 WV005656	ALLMAN,	111,906	111,906		111,906	111,906	\$	111,906 \$
4104497 Conventional	21	0412124497	04497	311630 WV005749	WOODVARD	89,403	89,400	3	89,403	89,403	\$	89,403 \$
4104515 Conventional	21	0412124515	04515	311631 WV005860	LAWSON,	98,873	98,872	1	98,873	98,873	\$	98,873 \$
4104537 Conventional	21	0412124537	04537	311634 WV005818	ALKIRE,	64,828	64,827	1	64,828	64,828	\$	64,828 \$
4104531 Conventional	21	0413134531	04531	311631 WV005815	LUNSFORD	83,758	83,758		83,758	83,758	\$	83,758 \$
4104532 Conventional	21	0413134532	04532	311637 WV005821	QUEEN,	112,238	112,237	1	112,238	112,238	\$	112,238 \$
4104534 Conventional	21	0413134534	04534	311635 WV005819	HACKER,	69,676	60,575	9,101	69,676	65,014	\$	4,662 \$
4104536 Conventional	21	0413134536	04536	311637 WV005816	LIFE, N	120,453	117,546	2,907	120,453	115,734	\$	4,719 \$
4104543 Conventional	21	0413134538	04538	311636 WV005820	ALLMAN,	4,716	500	4,216	4,716	500	\$	4,216 \$
4104546 Conventional	21	0413134546	04546	311638 WV005859	RAMSBUR	117,513	80,973	36,540	120,745	115,834	\$	4,911 \$
4104547 Conventional	21	0413134547	04547	311639 WV005860	GOODWIN	56,054	23,221	32,833	117,513	114,242	\$	3,271 \$
4104549 Conventional	21	0413134549	04549	311652 WV005886	GOODWIN	23,997	15,458	8,539	23,997	15,459	\$	8,538 \$
4104558 Conventional	21	0413134558	04558	311651 WV005885	ALLMAN,	36,299	36,267	32	36,299	36,267	\$	32 \$
4104560 Conventional	21	0413134560	04560	311655 WV005890	BATTEN,	58,981	58,979	2	58,981	58,981	\$	58,981 \$
4104561 Conventional	21	0413134561	04561	311658 WV005891	HACKERS	39,594	27,261	12,333	39,594	26,663	\$	12,931 \$
4104564 Conventional	21	0413134564	04564	311649 WV005883	BENNETT	10,342	500	9,842	10,342	500	\$	9,842 \$
4104567 Conventional	21	0413134567	04567	311670 WV005917	SWISHER	30,662	26,481	4,181	30,662	26,481	\$	4,181 \$
4104568 Conventional	21	0413134568	04568	311670 WV005915	GOULD,	21,508	20,125	1,383	21,508	20,125	\$	1,383 \$
4104570 Conventional	21	0413134570	04570	311658 WV005893	BROWN M	87,168	76,794	10,374	87,168	82,449	\$	4,719 \$
4104571 Conventional	21	0413134571	04571	311671 WV005916	HINZMAN	27,323	20,857	6,466	27,323	20,857	\$	6,466 \$
4104572 Conventional	21	0413134572	04572	311654 WV005889	SUTTON,	27,432	27,432		27,432	27,432	\$	27,432 \$
4104576 Conventional	21	0413134576	04576	311689 WV005914	LAWSON,	49,940	32,932	17,008	49,940	44,493	\$	5,447 \$
4104584 Conventional	21	0413134584	04584	311657 WV005892	BUTCHER	33,490	31,358	2,132	33,490	31,359	\$	2,131 \$
4104585 Conventional	21	0413134585	04585	311668 WV005912	LINGER,	7,252	500	6,752	7,252	500	\$	6,752 \$
4104588 Conventional	21	0413134588	04588	311650 WV005884	MORRIS	16,058	4,158	11,900	16,058	4,158	\$	11,900 \$
4104672 Conventional	21	0413134672	04672	311681 WV006157	GOODWIN	7,084	500	6,584	7,084	500	\$	6,584 \$

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNX State Appraised Value	CNX Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNX Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNX Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Value Difference
4104624 Conventional	21	0413134624	04624	311683	WV006159 ALLMAN,	12,138	5,051	7,087	12,138	5,051	7,087
4104589 Conventional	21	0414144589	04589	311674	WV005994 WOODFOR	72,358	72,357	1	72,358	72,358	-
4104597 Conventional	21	0414144597	04597	311675	WV005995 WILLIAM	119,747	119,747	-	119,747	119,747	-
4104620 Conventional	21	0414144620	04620	311653	WV005987 LAW, W	18,243	6,929	11,314	18,243	6,928	11,315
4104621 Conventional	21	0414144621	04621	311666	WV005910 SMITH,	19,441	16,475	2,966	19,441	16,475	2,966
4104623 Conventional	21	0414144623	04623	311682	WV006158 ALLMAN,	19,683	8,905	10,778	19,683	8,905	10,778
4104664 Conventional	21	0414144664	04664	311724	WV006288 EDMISTO	83,298	81,179	2,119	83,298	78,766	4,532
4104671 Conventional	21	0414144671	04671	311723	WV006287 WILLIAM	41,762	41,762	-	41,762	41,762	-
4104678 Conventional	21	0414144678	04678	311725	WV006289 FORINAS	92,121	92,121	-	92,121	92,121	-
4104694 Conventional	21	0414144694	04694	311722	WV006286 QUEEN,	91,554	90,707	847	91,554	86,909	4,645
4104735 Conventional	21	0415154735	04735	311755	WV006365 SUTTON,	36,021	37,573	-	36,021	37,574	-
4104780 Conventional	21	0415154780	04780	311760	WV006402 MARY W	427,911	286,017	139,894	427,911	427,911	-
4104785 Conventional	21	0415154785	04785	311759	WV006401 NOAH LI	112,047	112,047	-	112,047	112,047	-
4104791 Conventional	21	0415154791	04791	311761	WV006403 BENNETT	20,361	20,361	-	20,361	15,880	4,481
4104798 Conventional	21	0415154798	04798	311763	WV006405 J C SWI	138,216	138,216	-	138,216	138,216	-
4104799 Conventional	21	0415154799	04799	311768	WV006406 F H BON	104,016	91,112	12,904	104,016	99,407	4,609
4104910 Conventional	21	0416164910	04910	311884	WV008560 LUNSFOR	86,853	85,423	1,430	86,853	82,163	4,690
4104911 Conventional	21	0416164911	04911	311888	WV008566 ALKIRE,	69,480	69,479	1	69,480	69,480	-
4104933 Conventional	21	0416164933	04933	311887	WV008565 LIFE, N	115,419	115,418	1	115,419	115,419	-
4104954 Conventional	21	0416164954	04954	311886	WV008562 BONNETT	88,866	88,866	-	88,866	88,866	-
4104925 Conventional	21	0417174925	04925	311882	WV008558 HORNBEK	52,146	51,365	781	52,146	51,364	782
4104926 Conventional	21	0417174926	04926	311883	WV008559 HORNBEK	81,344	81,342	2	81,344	81,344	-
4105020 Conventional	21	0417175020	05020	311885	WV008561 STACK,	22,093	4,948	17,145	22,093	4,947	17,146
4105101 Conventional	21	0418185101	05101	312048	WV014610 BENNETT	20,316	18,019	2,297	20,316	18,019	2,297
4105190 Conventional	21	0418185190	05190	312130	WV015052 RHODES,	48,647	45,656	2,991	48,647	45,656	2,991
4105191 Conventional	21	0418185191	05191	312131	WV015053 RHODES,	28,045	27,525	520	28,045	25,237	2,808
4105200 Conventional	21	0418185200	05200	312047	WV014609 HAYS ME	49,124	49,124	-	49,124	49,124	-
4105210 Conventional	21	0418185210	05210	312062	WV014630 WOODFOR	59,787	59,787	-	59,787	59,787	-

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNX State Appraised Value	CNX Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNX Value Difference	Property Tax Division Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	Property Tax Division Difference
4105227 Conventional	21	0418185227	05222	312045 WV014607	OHARA	25,317	25,316	1	25,317	25,317	\$
4105226 Conventional	21	0418185226	05226	312046 WV014608	OHARA	152,894	152,892	2	152,894	152,894	\$
4105227 Conventional	21	0418185227	05227	312063 WV014631	WOODBORO	38,657	38,657		38,657	38,657	\$
4105370 Conventional	21	0420105370	05370	312152 WV015178	NEELY	125,235	119,853	5,382	125,235	120,498	\$ 4,737
4105402 Conventional	21	0420105402	05402	312050 WV014612	HALL, M	42,341	42,341		42,341	42,341	\$
4105432 Conventional	21	0420115432	05432	312277 WV033241	HUNTER	41,375	33,726	7,649	41,375	37,714	\$ 3,661
4105470 Conventional	21	0420115470	05470	312193 WV031235	UNION N	155,805	99,381	56,424	155,805	155,805	\$
4105471 Conventional	21	0420115471	05471	312194 WV031236	UNION N	89,086	87,184	1,902	89,086	84,591	\$ 4,495
4105503 Conventional	21	0420115503	05503	312252 WV032873	SMITH	92,421	92,421		92,421	92,421	\$
4105511 Conventional	21	0420115511	05511	312191 WV031229	LUNSFOR	75,392	75,392		75,392	75,392	\$
4105512 Conventional	21	0420115512	05512	312250 WV032866	SUTTON	76,205	76,205		76,205	76,205	\$
4105513 Conventional	21	0420115513	05513	312251 WV032867	SUTTON	57,522	57,522		57,522	57,522	\$
4105518 Conventional	21	0420115518	05518	320187 WV034624	BENNETT	26,373	500	25,873	26,373	500	\$ 25,873
4105520 Conventional	21	0420115520	05520	312246 WV032862	JEWELL	201,489	201,489	3	201,489	201,489	\$
4105526 Conventional	21	0420115526	05526	312241 WV032838	LYLE, R	113,627	107,970	5,657	113,627	106,794	\$ 4,833
4105528 Conventional	21	0420115528	05528	310320 207403277	BECKET	102,421	97,518	4,903	102,421	97,776	\$ 4,645
4105532 Conventional	21	0420115532	05532	312188 WV031220	DEERIE	94,436	94,436		94,436	94,436	\$
4105533 Conventional	21	0420115533	05533	312210 WV032382	DEERIE	120,028	120,028	2	120,028	120,028	\$
4105563 Conventional	21	0420115563	05563	312192 WV031234	OLDAKER	42,814	42,814		42,814	42,814	\$
4105570 Conventional	21	0420115570	05570	312187 WV031218	DEERIE	72,940	53,173	19,767	72,940	68,994	\$ 3,946
4105579 Conventional	21	0420115579	05579	312249 WV032865	BONNETT	50,148	50,148		50,148	50,148	\$
4105580 Conventional	21	0420115580	05580	312253 WV032880	WOODYAR	80,350	80,350		80,350	80,350	\$
4105582 Conventional	21	0420115582	05582	309997 WV032836	HARDROC	117,632	117,632		117,632	117,632	\$
4105588 Conventional	21	0420115588	05588	309999 WV032855	ROGERS	117,029	117,029		117,029	117,029	\$
4105589 Conventional	21	0420115589	05589	309998 WV032837	ROGERS	35,059	27,530	7,529	35,059	25,357	\$ 9,702
4105521 Conventional	21	0420125521	05521	312247 WV032863	HARDMAN	179,466	96,965	82,501	179,466	179,466	\$
4105522 Conventional	21	0420125522	05522	312248 WV032864	LAWSON	103,506	49,970	53,536	103,506	98,372	\$ 5,134
4105573 Conventional	21	0420125573	05573	309965 207404031	RINEHA	27,828	17,460	10,368	27,828	17,184	\$ 10,644
4105602 Conventional	21	0420125602	05602	312361 WV034789	DETAMOR	123,255	123,255		123,255	123,255	\$
4105609 Conventional	21	0420125609	05609	312245 WV032857	STACK	95,557	95,556	1	95,557	95,557	\$
4105637 Conventional	21	0420125637	05637	312229 WV032739	GOULD	35,636	34,328	1,308	35,636	31,823	\$ 3,813

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNX State Appraised Value	CNX Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNX Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNX Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Appraised Value	Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	Property Tax Division Value Difference
4100001 Conventional		21	0450000001	00001	313942 WEWVT007450	6,562	500	6,062	6,562	500	500	6,062
4100020 Conventional		21	0450000020	00020	313966 WEWVT007773 (S)	1,746	500	1,246	1,746	500	500	1,246
4100141 Conventional		21	0450000141	00141	314198 WEWVT009170 (G)	9,995	500	9,495	9,995	500	500	9,495
4100426 Conventional		21	0450000426	00426	314348 WEWVT010253 (M)	8,568	500	8,068	8,568	500	500	8,068
4100485 Conventional		21	0450000485	00485	314362 WEWVT010279	2,683	500	2,183	2,683	500	500	2,183
4100750 Conventional		21	0450000750	00750	314384 WEWVT010324 (L)	3,218	500	2,718	3,218	500	500	2,718
4100787 Conventional		21	0450000787	00787	314386 WEWVT010329 (P)	6,768	500	6,268	6,768	500	500	6,268
4100788 Conventional		21	0450000788	00788	314387 WEWVT010330	2,598	500	2,098	2,598	500	500	2,098
4100831 Conventional		21	0450000831	00831	314392 WEWVT010337 (G)	1,506	500	1,006	1,506	500	500	1,006
4100833 Conventional		21	0450000833	00833	314395 WEWVT010346 (L)	11,562	1,292	10,270	11,562	1,292	1,292	10,270
4100908 Conventional		21	0450000908	00908	314407 WEWVT010363 (S)	2,478	500	1,978	2,478	500	500	1,978
4100976 Conventional		21	0450000976	00976	311191 WEWVT010387 (W)	8,497	500	7,997	8,497	500	500	7,997
4101005 Conventional		21	0450001005	01005	311192 WEWVT010426 (G)	7,539	500	7,039	7,539	500	500	7,039
4101022 Conventional		21	0450001022	01022	314426 WEWVT010406	5,840	500	5,340	5,840	500	500	5,340
4101118 Conventional		21	0450001118	01118	314449 WEWVT010446	28,127	25,661	2,466	28,127	25,660	25,660	2,467
4101166 Conventional		21	0450001166	01166	314463 WEWVT010501	83,300	83,300	0	83,300	83,300	83,300	0
4101276 Conventional		21	0450001276	01276	314479 WEWVT010534	7,558	500	7,058	7,558	500	500	7,058
4101281 Conventional		21	0450001281	01281	314484 WEWVT010540	16,480	6,188	10,292	16,480	6,188	6,188	10,292
4101284 Conventional		21	0450001284	01284	311194 WEWVT010547 (W)	4,372	500	3,872	4,372	500	500	3,872
4101356 Conventional		21	0450001356	01356	314514 WEWVT010669	52,479	52,479	0	52,479	52,479	52,479	0
4101366 Conventional		21	0450001366	01366	314516 WEWVT010676	5,755	500	5,255	5,755	500	500	5,255
4101377 Conventional		21	0450001377	01377	314518 WEWVT010678	41,836	41,836	0	41,836	41,836	41,836	0
4101383 Conventional		21	0450001383	01383	314517 WEWVT010677	52,536	52,536	0	52,536	52,536	52,536	0
4101391 Conventional		21	0450001391	01391	314522 WEWVT010683	41,177	41,177	0	41,177	41,177	41,177	0
4101426 Conventional		21	0450001426	01426	314294 WEWVT010055 (B)	8,187	500	7,687	8,187	500	500	7,687
4101459 Conventional		21	0450001459	01459	314564 WEWVT010778	40,172	40,172	0	40,172	40,172	40,172	0
4101538 Conventional		21	0450001538	01538	314588 WEWVT010880	31,469	29,165	2,304	31,469	29,165	29,165	2,304
4101554 Conventional		21	0450001554	01554	314299 WEWVT010062 (J)	18,346	7,948	10,398	18,346	7,949	7,949	10,397
4101565 Conventional		21	0450001565	01565	314618 WEWVT010950	95,893	95,893	0	95,893	95,893	95,893	0
4101567 Conventional		21	0450001567	01567	314613 WEWVT010940 (L)	18,450	9,758	8,692	18,450	9,758	9,758	8,692
4101597 Conventional		21	0450001597	01597	314630 WEWVT010990	37,124	37,124	0	37,124	37,124	37,124	0

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNX State Appraised Value	CNX Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNX Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNX Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Supreme Court Decision	Property Tax Division Value Difference
4101647 Conventional	21	0450001647	01647	309973 WEWVT011036		47,462	47,462		47,462	47,462	
4101652 Conventional	21	0450001652	01652	314298 WEWVT010061 (Q)		18,467	18,467	10,348	18,467	8,118	10,349
4101653 Conventional	21	0450001653	01653	311184 WEWVT008500		75,611	46,207	29,404	75,611	73,887	1,724
4101675 Conventional	21	0450001675	01675	309974 WEWVT011131		92,861	92,860		92,861	92,861	
4101677 Conventional	21	0450001677	01677	309976 WEWVT011152		30,811	30,386	425	30,811	30,385	426
4101740 Conventional	21	0450001740	01740	309977 WEWVT011129		32,279	32,279		32,279	32,279	
4101743 Conventional	21	0450001743	01743	314687 WEWVT011220		14,189	3,966	10,223	14,189	3,964	10,225
4101755 Conventional	21	0450001755	01755	311185 WEWVT008502 (H)		19,695	9,855	9,840	19,695	9,855	9,840
4101764 Conventional	21	0450001764	01764	313689 WEWVT003764		7,740	500	7,240	7,740	500	7,240
4101777 Conventional	21	0450001777	01777	314708 WEWVT011315		28,471	26,265	2,206	28,471	26,265	2,206
4101788 Conventional	21	0450001788	01788	314082 WEWVT008501 (H)		16,240	5,876	10,364	16,240	5,876	10,364
4101790 Conventional	21	0450001790	01790	313727 WEWVT004423 (F)		11,115	500	10,615	11,115	500	10,615
4101791 Conventional	21	0450001791	01791	314710 WEWVT011333		120,422	120,422		120,422	120,422	
4101805 Conventional	21	0450001805	01805	313669 WEWVT003437 (B)		15,999	4,839	11,160	15,999	4,839	11,160
4101846 Conventional	21	0450001846	01846	311202 WEWVT011439		38,554	38,553	1	38,554	38,554	
4101878 Conventional	21	0450001878	01878	314743 WEWVT011524		20,737	11,443	9,294	20,737	11,444	9,293
4101880 Conventional	21	0450001880	01880	314744 WEWVT011525		41,430	41,428	2	41,430	41,430	
4101891 Conventional	21	0450001891	01891	313699 WEWVT003911		22,755	14,558	8,197	22,755	14,559	8,196
4101909 Conventional	21	0450001909	01909	314763 WEWVT011619		4,276	500	3,776	4,276	500	3,776
4101913 Conventional	21	0450001913	01913	309980 WEWVT011654		39,463	39,463		39,463	39,463	
4101904 Conventional	21	0450001914	01904	314758 WEWVT011594		44,254	44,252	2	44,254	44,254	
4101915 Conventional	21	0450001915	01915	314761 WEWVT011617		22,533	16,161	6,372	22,533	16,161	6,372
4101946 Conventional	21	0450001946	01946	309981 WEWVT011712		64,062	64,061	1	64,062	64,062	
4101957 Conventional	21	0450001957	01957	314762 WEWVT011618		11,783	1,066	10,717	11,783	1,065	10,718
4101964 Conventional	21	0450001964	01964	314762 WEWVT011618		51,154	51,154		51,154	51,154	
4101972 Conventional	21	0450001972	01972	314806 WEWVT011817		19,399	7,521	11,878	19,399	7,521	11,878
4101973 Conventional	21	0450001973	01973	314820 WEWVT011877 (G)		28,599	22,349	6,250	28,599	20,914	7,685
4102044 Conventional	21	0450002044	02044	314874 WEWVT012124		57,837	57,837		57,837	57,837	
4102065 Conventional	21	0450002065	02065	314876 WEWVT012150		11,827	1,102	10,725	11,827	1,102	10,725
						54,212	54,212		54,212	54,212	
						14,539	500	14,039	14,539	500	14,039

CNK Gas Company, LLC
Tax Year 7/1/15-6/30/16
Lewes County, WV

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNK State Appraised Value	CNK Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNK Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNX Appraised Value	Property Tax Division CNX Decision	Property Tax Division Value Difference
4102181	Conventional	21	0450002181	02181	314912 WEWVT0012449	8,685	500	8,185	8,685	500	8,185
4102182	Conventional	21	0450002182	02182	311221 WEWVT012450	19,498	2,127	17,371	19,498	2,127	17,371
4102190	Conventional	21	0450002190	02190	313521 WEWVT000375	3,113	500	2,613	3,113	500	2,613
4102201	Conventional	21	0450002201	02201	313584 WEWVT002094	6,574	500	6,074	6,574	500	6,074
4102202	Conventional	21	0450002202	02202	313589 WEWVT002134	3,830	500	3,330	3,830	500	3,330
4102203	Conventional	21	0450002203	02203	313593 WEWVT002150	8,585	500	8,085	8,585	500	8,085
4102205	Conventional	21	0450002205	02205	313594 WEWVT002203	5,669	500	5,169	5,669	500	5,169
4102206	Conventional	21	0450002206	02206	313601 WEWVT002310	5,063	500	4,563	5,063	500	4,563
4102207	Conventional	21	0450002207	02207	313605 WEWVT002354	44,633	44,633		44,633	44,633	
4102209	Conventional	21	0450002209	02209	313608 WEWVT002371	3,407	500	2,907	3,407	500	2,907
4102210	Conventional	21	0450002210	02210	313608 WEWVT002433	6,880	500	6,380	6,880	500	6,380
4102216	Conventional	21	0450002216	02216	313616 WEWVT002571	11,811	670	11,141	11,811	670	11,141
4102226	Conventional	21	0450002226	02226	313630 WEWVT002856	5,393	500	4,893	5,393	500	4,893
4102227	Conventional	21	0450002227	02227	313631 WEWVT002863	1,253	500	753	1,253	500	753
4102235	Conventional	21	0450002235	02235	313645 WEWVT003179	725	500	225	725	500	225
4102241	Conventional	21	0450002241	02241	313659 WEWVT003369	5,917	500	5,417	5,917	500	5,417
4102242	Conventional	21	0450002242	02242	313665 WEWVT003402	3,925	500	3,425	3,925	500	3,425
4102243	Conventional	21	0450002243	02243	313666 WEWVT003404	3,128	500	2,628	3,128	500	2,628
4102247	Conventional	21	0450002247	02247	313682 WEWVT003643	6,766	500	6,266	6,766	500	6,266
4102251	Conventional	21	0450002251	02251	313691 WEWVT003797	6,144	500	5,644	6,144	500	5,644
4102252	Conventional	21	0450002252	02252	313697 WEWVT003894	4,686	500	4,186	4,686	500	4,186
4102255	Conventional	21	0450002255	02255	313700 WEWVT003916	8,683	500	8,183	8,683	500	8,183
4102263	Conventional	21	0450002263	02263	313712 WEWVT004161	3,103	500	2,603	3,103	500	2,603
4102268	Conventional	21	0450002268	02268	313720 WEWVT004302	8,092	500	7,592	8,092	500	7,592
4102273	Conventional	21	0450002273	02273	313738 WEWVT004646	6,295	500	5,795	6,295	500	5,795
4102274	Conventional	21	0450002274	02274	313739 WEWVT004647	6,501	500	6,001	6,501	500	6,001
4102275	Conventional	21	0450002275	02275	313741 WEWVT004697	4,884	500	4,384	4,884	500	4,384
4102276	Conventional	21	0450002276	02276	313743 WEWVT004707	5,231	500	4,731	5,231	500	4,731
4102282	Conventional	21	0450002282	02282	313757 WEWVT004944	6,346	500	5,846	6,346	500	5,846
4102285	Conventional	21	0450002285	02285	313775 WEWVT005315	7,552	500	7,052	7,552	500	7,052
4102287	Conventional	21	0450002287	02287	313777 WEWVT005332	28,127	13,177	14,950	28,127	13,177	14,950

Formatted API	Well Type	CV	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNX State Appraised Value	CNX Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNX Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNX Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Supreme Court Decision	Property Tax Division Value Difference
4102299 Conventional	21	0450002299	02299	313963	WEWVT007760 (A	20,767	5,984	14,783	20,767	5,983	14,784
4102385 Conventional	21	0450002385	02385	314297	WEWVT010060 (Q	16,361	500	15,861	16,361	500	15,861
4102386 Conventional	21	0450002386	02386	314300	WEWVT010063 (U	4,263	500	3,763	4,263	500	3,763
4102704 Conventional	21	0450002704	02704	314081	WEWVT008491 (H	6,204	500	5,704	6,204	500	5,704
4102722 Conventional	21	0450002722	02722	311183	WEWVT008499 (W	11,552	538	11,014	11,552	538	11,014
4102733 Conventional	21	0450002733	02733	314296	WEWVT010057 (L	14,970	3,592	11,378	14,970	3,593	11,377
4103085 Conventional	21	0450003085	03085	314943	WEWVT012706	1,532	500	1,032	1,532	500	1,032
4104261 Conventional	21	0460004261	04261	309428	200710577 LINGER	13,948	1,908	12,040	13,948	1,908	12,040
4103849 Conventional	21	0460004262	04262	309427	200710576 PETERS	57,408	57,408	0	57,408	57,408	0
4103872 Conventional	21	0470003849	03849	309377	200710514 GARTON	19,782	9,050	10,732	19,782	9,050	10,732
4104009 Conventional	21	0470003872	03872	309401	200710538 SCOTT	35,662	35,144	518	35,662	35,144	518
4104282 Conventional	21	0470004009	04009	309404	200710543 SCOTT	39,764	39,764	0	39,764	39,764	0
4104283 Conventional	21	0470004282	04282	309772	200711412 CALVIN	23,480	14,649	8,831	23,480	14,649	8,831
4104342 Conventional	21	0490004283	04283	309771	200711411 ALLMAN	29,519	17,301	12,218	29,519	21,878	7,641
4104355 Conventional	21	0490004342	04342	309785	200711538 CLAUDI	29,191	23,996	5,195	29,191	23,994	5,197
4103359 Conventional	21	0490004355	04355	309849	200711544 GSM 1	65,724	35,839	29,885	65,724	60,806	4,918
4103990 Conventional	21	0490004359	04359	309853	200711658 GSM 2	3,352	500	2,852	3,352	500	2,852
4104414 Conventional	21	0610003990	03990	309305	200710247 JEWELL	4,500	500	4,000	4,500	500	4,000
4104415 Conventional	21	0611114415	04415	311597	WV005493 LINGER,	11,125	500	10,625	11,125	500	10,625
4100330 Conventional	21	0611114415	04415	311596	WV005491 SMITH,	15,552	3,547	12,005	15,552	3,547	12,005
4100366 Conventional	21	0650000330	00330	101341	JONES	576	500	76	576	500	76
4100369 Conventional	21	0650000366	00366	314326	WEWVT010181	1,635	500	1,135	1,635	500	1,135
4100376 Conventional	21	0650000369	00369	314334	WEWVT010196	3,217	500	2,717	3,217	500	2,717
4100391 Conventional	21	0650000376	00376	314337	WEWVT010206	1,218	500	718	1,218	500	718
4100406 Conventional	21	0650000391	00391	314343	WEWVT010232	2,114	500	1,614	2,114	500	1,614
4100456 Conventional	21	0650000406	00406	314345	WEWVT010247	657	500	157	657	500	157
4100457 Conventional	21	0650000456	00456	314349	WEWVT010256	640	500	140	640	500	140
4100490 Conventional	21	0650000457	00457	314350	WEWVT010257	1,620	500	1,120	1,620	500	1,120
4100636 Conventional	21	0650000490	00490	314357	WEWVT010268	11,288	500	10,788	11,288	500	10,788
4100637 Conventional	21	0650000636	00636	314369	WEWVT010299	3,464	500	2,964	3,464	500	2,964
4100637 Conventional	21	0650000637	00637	314370	WEWVT010300	16,028	4,875	11,153	16,028	4,876	11,152

CNX Gas Company, LLC
Tax Year 7/1/15-6/30/16
Lewis County, WV

Formatted API	Well Type	CY	ACCOUNT	API	PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CNX State Appraised Value	CNX Appraised Value Consistent with Supreme Court Decision	CNX Value Difference	Property Tax Division CNX Appraised Value	Property Tax Division Supreme Court Decision Value	Property Tax Division Difference
4100825 Conventional	21	0650000825	00825	314393	WEWV010347	5,679	500	5,179	5,679	500	5,179
4100876 Conventional	21	0650000876	00876	314403	WEWV010359	1,370	500	870	1,370	500	870
4100877 Conventional	21	0650000877	00877	314404	WEWV010360	1,445	500	945	1,445	500	945
4100878 Conventional	21	0650000878	00878	314405	WEWV010361	9,819	500	9,319	9,819	500	9,319
4100940 Conventional	21	0650000940	00940	314435	WEWV010420	19,510	9,587	9,923	19,510	9,586	9,924
4100957 Conventional	21	0650000957	00957	314425	WEWV010403	16,747	5,775	10,972	16,747	5,777	10,970
4100962 Conventional	21	0650000962	00962	314437	WEWV010423	6,662	500	6,162	6,662	500	6,162
4101033 Conventional	21	0650001033	01033	314438	WEWV010428	6,858	500	6,358	6,858	500	6,358
4101034 Conventional	21	0650001034	01034	314439	WEWV010429	632	500	132	632	500	132
4101051 Conventional	21	0650001051	01051	314440	WEWV010430	7,058	500	6,558	7,058	500	6,558
4101108 Conventional	21	0650001108	01108	314442	WEWV010434	4,035	500	3,535	4,035	500	3,535
4101109 Conventional	21	0650001109	01109	314444	WEWV010436	5,086	500	4,586	5,086	500	4,586
4101111 Conventional	21	0650001111	01111	314445	WEWV010438	1,484	500	984	1,484	500	984
4101117 Conventional	21	0650001117	01117	314447	WEWV010441	22,917	12,641	10,276	22,917	12,640	10,277
4101128 Conventional	21	0650001128	01128	314446	WEWV010439	3,217	500	2,717	3,217	500	2,717
4101179 Conventional	21	0650001179	01179	314465	WEWV010504	2,856	500	2,356	2,856	500	2,356
4101202 Conventional	21	0650001202	01202	314467	WEWV010508	1,496	500	996	1,496	500	996
4101207 Conventional	21	0650001207	01207	314468	WEWV010507	14,121	2,697	11,424	14,121	2,697	11,424
4101208 Conventional	21	0650001208	01208	314471	WEWV010516	4,348	500	3,848	4,348	500	3,848
4101274 Conventional	21	0650001274	01274	314480	WEWV010635	3,994	500	3,494	3,994	500	3,494
4101280 Conventional	21	0650001280	01280	314481	WEWV010536	1,690	500	1,190	1,690	500	1,190
4101288 Conventional	21	0650001288	01288	314492	WEWV010614	10,473	500	9,973	10,473	500	9,973
4101323 Conventional	21	0650001323	01323	314503	WEWV010644	1,185	500	685	1,185	500	685
4101374 Conventional	21	0650001374	01374	314505	WEWV010646	4,833	500	4,333	4,833	500	4,333
4101345 Conventional	21	0650001345	01345	314504	WEWV010645	1,545	500	1,045	1,545	500	1,045
4101348 Conventional	21	0650001348	01348	314512	WEWV010664	2,714	500	2,214	2,714	500	2,214
4101668 Conventional	21	0650001668	01668	314668	WEWV0101128	1,773	500	1,273	1,773	500	1,273
						26,771,001	21,344,168	5,426,833	26,584,032	22,086,176	4,497,856

Note - Gray shaded values reflects minimum working interest appraisal of \$500 because value calculation resulted in value of less than \$500.