FILED

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF KANAWHA COUNTY, WEST VIRGINIS UM 8: 25
BUSINESS COURT DIVISION

CATHY S. GATSON, CLERK KANAWHA COUNTY CIRCUIT COURT

CITY OF CHARLESTON, and all others similarly situated, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

V.

Civil Action No.: 16-C-1552

WEST VIRGINIA PAVING, INC., et al.,

Defendants.

STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA, ex rel. PATRICK MORRISEY, ATTORNEY GENERAL, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Civil Action No.: 17-C-41

CRH, plc, et al.,

Defendants.

ORDER GRANTING MOTION TO SEAL

On this day, the WVP Defendants, by counsel, presented a motion to seal another motion attached thereto as Exhibit A. As set forth in the Motion to Seal, the underlying Motion attached thereto, and for other reasons appearing to the Court, the underlying Motion thereto contains sensitive material that would be harmful if made publicly available. Namely, full disclosure of the contents of the Motion would harm the interests of the WVP Defendants and the interests of an entity that is not a party to this litigation. Accordingly, the Motion to Seal is hereby GRANTED and the Court ORDERS that the Motion attached thereto as Exhibit A be considered UNDER SEAL. The underlying SEALED Motion is to be considered FILED in the above-referenced case.

HIL

¹ CRH, plc; Oldcastle, Inc.; Oldcastle Materials, Inc.; West Virginia Paving, Inc.; Southern West Virginia Paving, Inc.; Southern West Virginia Asphalt, Inc.; and Camden Materials, LLC.

The Clerk shall serve a certified copy of this Order to all parties of record.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Enter: _1/7/18

Chomesel You James H. Young, Jr., Circuit Judge

Prepared and agreed to by:

R. Booth Goodwin II (W. Va. Bar No. 7165)

Carrie Goodwin Fenwick (W. Va. Bar No. 7164)

Richard D. Owen (W. Va. Bar No. 2794)

W. Jeffrey-Vollmer (W. Va. Bar No. 10277)

Lucas R. White (W. Va. Bar No. 12501)

GOODWIN & GOODWIN LLP

300 Summers Street, Suite 1500

Charleston, West Virginia 24328

T: (304) 356-7000

F: (304) 344-9692

rbg@goodwingoodwin.com

cgf@goodwingoodwin.com

rdo@goodwingoodwin.com

wiv@goodwingoodwin.com

lrw@goodwingoodwin.com

Counsel for WVP Defendants

Judge Wilkes Judge Young Bas CH

R. Groodwin B. Bailey

other (please indicate) 5 Travis By: certified/1st class mail J Storage

D. Davis

m. Farrell C. Johnstone

. 2

STADE LIE MIEST MINIMINE
COUNTY OF KANAWHA, SS
I, CATHY S, BATSON, CLERK OF CIRCUIT COURT OF SAID COUNTY
AND IN SAID STATE, DO HEREBY CERTIFY THAT THE FOREGOING
IS A TRUE COPY FROM THE RECORDS OF SAID COURT
GIVEN UNDER MY HAND AND SEAL OF SAID COURT THIS