IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF BERKELEY COUNTY, WEST VIRGINIA

UNIVERSITY HEALTHCARE FOUNDATION, INC. f/k/a CITY HOSPITAL FOUNDATION, INC., Appellant,

٧.

LARRY A. HESS, ASSESSOR OF BERKELEY COUNTY, WEST VIRGINIA, and MARK W. MATKOVICH, STATE TAX COMMISSIONER, Respondents. CASE NO. 15-AARGINIA M. SINE, CLERK
CASE NO. 15-AARGINIA M. SINE, CLERK

RESPONDENT HESS' RESPONSE TO PETITION

COMES NOW, Larry A. Hess, Assessor of Berkeley County, and makes his response to the Petitioner's Petition, as follows:

- 1. That, the Respondent Assessor Admits the allegations set forth in Paragraphs 1, 2, 3, 4 a, b, c, d, and e, and Paragraph 5.
- 2. That, he Admits upon information and belief the allegations set out in Paragraph 6 a, b, and c.

WHEREFORE, the Respondent Assessor joins the Petitioner in its recommendation and request that this matter be referred to the Business Court Division and consolidated with that certain case pending before the Circuit Court of Berkeley County, West Virginia, Business Court Division, Case No. 14-AA-4, styled *University Healthcare Foundation, Inc. f/k/a City Hospital Foundation, Inc. v. Larry A. Hess, Assessor of Berkeley County, West Virginia and Mark W. Matkovich, State Tax Commissioner;* further that the Court will affirm the Assessor's denial of the Petitioner's application for exemption of the DMC from 2015 *ad valorem* property taxes; and, affirm the Respondent Tax

Commissioner's ruling against the Petitioner with respect to the tax exemption issue for Tax Year 2015.

LARRY A. HESS, ASSESSOR OF BERKELEY COUNTY, WEST VIRGINIA

By Counsel

Vorwood Bentley III, Esquire

State Bar No. 4234

Berkeley County Council

400 West Stephen Street, Suite 201

Martinsburg, West Virginia 25401

304-267-5009

CIRCUIT CLEAK

2015 APR 28 AM 10: 34

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Norwood Bentley III, do hereby certify that I have served a true and accurate copy of the foregoing RESPONDENT HESS' RESPONSE TO PETITION upon the following, by electronic mail and by placing the same in the United States mail, postage pre-paid and directed as hereinbelow indicated, on this the 28th day April, 2015.

Michael E. Caryl, Esquire
J. Tyler Mayhew, Esquire
Bowles Rice LLP
Post Office Drawer 1419
Martinsburg, West Virginia 25402-1419
mcaryl@bowlesrice.com
tmayhew@bowlesrice.com

L. Wayne Williams, Esquire
Assistant Attorney General
Tax Division
Office of the Attorney General
Building 1, Room W435
Charleston, West Virginia 25305
L.wayne.williams@wvago.gov

Norwood Bentley III

resppetunivhealth I Saa6

Berkeley County Council

NORWOOD BENTLEY LEGAL DIRECTOR



400 West Stephen Street, Suite 201 MARTINSBURG, WEST VIRGINIA 25401 PHONE (304) 267-5009 Fax: (304) 267-5049

15. AA-b

April 28, 2015

The Honorable Virginia Sine, Clerk Circuit Court of Berkeley County Berkeley County Judicial Center 380 West South Street, Suite 2200 Martinsburg, West Virginia 25401

YIRGINIA M. SINE, CLERK

Re: UNIVERSITY HEALTHCARE FOUNDATION, INC.

f/k/a CITY HOSPITAL FOUNDATION, INC., v. LARRY HESS, ASSESSOR OF BERKELEY COUNTY, WEST VIRGINIA,

and MARK W. MATKOVICH, STATE TAX COMMISSIONER

Dear Clerk Sine:

I have enclosed for filing, the Respondent Hess' Response to Petition with regard to the above referenced case. A copy of the response has been delivered to all parties involved.

Thank you for your assistance.

Very truly yours

Cc:

Michael E. Caryl, Esquire J. Tyler Mayew, Esquire L. Wayne Williams, Esquire Larry Hess, Assessor