

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF KANAWHA COUNTY, WEST VIRGINIA

IN RE: YEAGER AIRPORT LITIGATION

CIVIL ACTION NO. 16-C-7000

THIS DOCUMENT APPLIES TO:

CENTRAL WEST VIRGINIA REGIONAL AIRPORT AUTHORITY, INC.,

Plaintiff

v.

Civil Action No. 15-C-1022 KAN

TRIAD ENGINEERING, INC., et al.,

Defendants.

ORDER REGARDING RECOMMENDATION OF DISCOVERY COMMISSIONER

On October 11, 2018, Discovery Commissioner David M. Kersey heard the following motions:

- 1. Defendant, Johnston-Morehouse-Dickey Company d/b/a JMD's Motion to Exclude Previously Undisclosed Opinions of Plaintiff's Expert Witnesses (Transaction ID 62397387);
- 2. Defendant, Nicolon Corporation's Motion to Exclude Previously Undisclosed Opinions of Plaintiff's Expert Witnesses (Transaction ID 62412721); and
- 3. Defendant, Novel Geo-Environmental, LLC's Motion to Exclude Previously Undisclosed Opinions of Plaintiff's Expert Witnesses (Transaction ID 62414232).

The Discovery Commissioner submitted a Report containing his recommendation, which Report was filed and served on all counsel of record on November 1, 2018 (Transaction ID 62617361). The Court has reviewed the Discovery Commissioner's Report and **FINDS** the Report is comprehensive, thorough, carefully considered, and well-reasoned.

Having conferred with one another to insure uniformity of their decision, as contemplated by Rule 26.07(a) of the West Virginia Trial Court Rules, the Presiding Judges unanimously

AFFIRM the Recommendation of the Discovery Commissioner as set forth in his Report filed

on November 1, 2018. Accordingly, the above-listed motions to exclude are **DENIED**. Within

seven (7) days from the date of this Order, Defendants JMD, Nicolon and Novel are ORDERED

to file a motion identifying what, if any, additional discovery is deemed necessary as a result of

Dr. Collin's report, and the amount of time needed to complete the additional discovery and

supplement their expert's disclosures. If no additional discovery is necessary, Defendants JMD,

Nicolon and Novel shall have fourteen (14) days from the date of this Order to amend their

expert's disclosures.

The Court further ORDERS Plaintiff and Defendants JMD, Nicolon, and Novel to each

pay one-half of the \$5,627.46 fee incurred by the Discovery Commissioner for work performed

in this matter, as described in the Report filed on November 1, 2018 and the attached invoice.

Each party's payment in the amount of \$2,813.73 shall be delivered to the Discovery

Commissioner for receipt no later than November 27, 2018.

It is so **ORDERED.**

ENTER: November 13, 2018.

/s/ John A. Hutchison

Lead Presiding Judge

Yeager Airport Litigation

2

Brewster, Morhous, Cameron, Caruth, Moore, Kersev & Stafford, PLLC

P.O. Box 529 Bluefield, WV 24701 304-325-9177 FEIN 55-0458286

Judge John A. Hutchison 222 Main Street Beckley, WV 25801

PAGE 1

BILLING DATE: 11/06/18

ACCT NO.: DMK-18700003

Judge John A. Hutchison Attn:

RE:

Yeager Airport Litigation CV#16-C-7000

CWVRAA v. Triad CV#15-C-1022 KAN

DATE	PROFESSIONAL SERVICES RENDERED	INDIV	TIME	AMOUNT
10/01/18	Telephone conference with Kim Fields regarding possible hearing on issues; reviewed file and serve for pleadings associated with issues to be heard by Mr. Kersey; telephone conference with Mr. Markins regarding objections to 30(b)(6) depositions; telephone conference with Mr. Trautwein regarding expert witnesses; called Thomas Bender regarding hearing on expert witness motions; telephone conference with Mr. Taylor regarding motion to exclude expert witnesses.	BSP	1.00	75.00
10/03/18	Telephone conference with John Palmer regarding Triad's motion to compel; telephone conferences with and e-mail to Ms. Field regarding hearing on expert witness disclosure; telephone conference with Chad Taylor regarding same.	BSP	1.00	75.00
10/04/18	Telephone conferences with all counsel regarding hearing; telephone conference with Deb Brogan regarding court reporter; e-mail to Kim Fields regarding notice; office conference with Mr. Kersey regarding hearing.	BSP	1.00	75.00
10/08/18	Telephone conference with Garrett Reporting regarding court reporter for hearing; telephone conference with Trautwein's office regarding motion; organized Nicolon's pleadings for hearing; organized Novel's motion.	BSP	1.00	75.00
10/09/18	Began review of exclusionary motions, attachments thereto and plaintiff's expert report.	DMK	3.10	620.00

Brewster, Morhous, Cameron, Caruth, Moore. Kersev & Stafford. PLLC P.O. Box 529

P.O. Box 529 Bluefield, WV 24701 304-325-9177 FEIN 55-0458286

222 Mai	hn A. Hutchison n Street WV 25801		PAGE 2 BILLING DATE ACC'T NO.:	: 11/06/18 DMK-18700003
10/09/18	Office conference with Mr. Kersey regarding plaintiff's expert report; telephone conference with Tim Bailey's office regarding expert report; reviewed File & Serve for expert report.	BSP	0,40	30.00
10/10/18	Completed review of Collins' Group expert report.	DMK	1.10	220.00
10/11/18	Travelled to Charleston, West Virginia, for hearing	DMK	5.00	1,000.00
10/22/18	Reviewed applicable legal authorities on issue of excluding plaintiffs supplemental expert opinion/report.	DMK	1.00	200.00
10/24/18	Reviewed file and serve for amended scheduling order.	BSP	0.40	30.00
10/26/18	Began work on recommendation.	DMK	4.50	900.00
10/26/18	Reviewed File & Serve for Novel Geo's expert report; telephone conference with Tim Bailey's office regarding Bruce Lacina's deposition transcript; reviewed File & Serve for depositions of witnesses; reviewed File & Serve for expert disclosures of plaintiff.	BSP	3.00	225.00
10/29/18	Continued work on recommendation.	DMK	2.10	420.00
10/30/18	Completed initial draft of recommendation.	DMK	2.10	420.00
10/31/18	Completed recommendation and submitted to Ms. Fields for filing.	DMK	3.50	700.00
Total of New Services:			30.20	5,065.00
DATE	EXPENSE		A	MOUNT
10/01/18	Long distance calls			0.44
10/03/18	Long distance calls			0.24
10/04/18	Long distance calls			0.68
10/08/18	Photocopies			12.60
10/11/18	Mileage to/from Charleston, WV, for hearing			118.80
10/11/18	Turnpike tolls to/from Charleston, WV, for hearing			12.00

Brewster, Morhous, Cameron, Caruth, Moore, Kersev & Stafford, PLLC

P.O. Box 529 Bluefield, WV 24701 304-325-9177 FEIN 55-0458286

Judge John A. Hutchison 222 Main Street Beckley, WV 25801

PAGE 3

BILLING DATE:

11/06/18

ACC'T NO.:

DMK-18700003

10/19/18

Garrett Reporting Service - hearing transcript

417.70

Total of New Expenses:

562.46

TIMEKEEPER RECAP

<u>Timekeeper</u>	<u>Indiv.</u>	<u>Time</u>	<u>Amount</u>	Effective Rate
B. Susanne Pulse	BSP	7.80	585.00	75.00
David M. Kersey	DMK	22.40	4,480.00	200.00

ACCOUNT SUMMARY

 PREVIOUS BALANCE:
 \$0.00

 NEW SERVICES:
 \$5,065.00

 NEW EXPENSES:
 \$562.46

 NEW PAYMENTS:
 \$0.00

 TOT. CURRENT PERIOD:
 \$5,627.46

 CURRENT BALANCE:
 \$5,627.46

GARRETT REPORTING SERVICE P. O. BOX 20200 CHARLESTON, WEST VIRGINIA 25362 PHONE 304-346-0460 FAX 304-757-7425

Brewster Morhous Cameron Caruth Moore Kersey & Stafford 418 Bland Street, P. O. Box 529 Bluefield, WV 24701-0529 INVOICE NO.:

20723

INVOICE DATE: 10/19/2018

REPORTER:

Wendy M. Thomas

David M. Kersey, Discovery Commissioner

ID# 38-376-8891

Job WT1149 (Yeager Airport Litigation) Central WV Regional Airport Authority, Inc. vs. Triad Engineering, Inc., et al

Date	Description	Amount
10/11/2018	Hearing -Motion to Exclude Opinions	
	of Plaintiff's Expert Witnesses	
10/11/2018	Transcript 42 pgs @ \$8.00 expedited	336.00
10/11/2018	Reporting Fee (Charleston)	75.00
10/11/2018	Etran - NC	
10/11/2018	PDF - NC	
10/11/2018	Postage	6.70
	Sub Total	417.70
	Paid	0.00
	Balance Due	417.70

Invoices not paid within 60 days are subject to 1.5% interest charges per month.